

FIRST SHAUGHNESSY ADVISORY DESIGN PANEL MINUTES

DATE: February 8, 2018
TIME: 4:00 pm
PLACE: Town Hall Meeting Room, Vancouver City Hall

PRESENT: MEMBERS OF THE FIRST SHAUGHNESSY DESIGN PANEL:

Kathy Reichert	Resident (Chair)
Erika Gardner	Resident, SHPOA
Michael Leckie	AIBC
Pamela Lennox	Resident, SHPOA
John Madden	Resident (Vice Chair)
Diane Kunic-Grandjean	REBGV
Mollie Massie	Vancouver Heritage Commission
Lu Xu	BCSLA
Richard Sirola	Resident, SHPOA

CITY STAFF

Susan Chang	Development Planner
Gavin Schaefer	Development Planner

LIAISONS:

George Affleck	City Councillor
----------------	-----------------

REGRETS:

Catherine Evans	Park Board Commissioner
Melissa de Genova	City Councillor
Frank Bailly	Resident
John Wang	Resident
Dean Gregory	BCSLA
Nicole Clement	Resident, SHPOA

RECORDING

SECRETARY: Kathy Cermeno

ITEMS REVIEWED AT THIS MEETING

1. 3809 Osler Street

Business Meeting

Chair Reichert called the meeting to order at 4:15pm and noted the presence of quorum.

Review of Minutes:

- Approval of January 18, 2018 minutes.

Business:

- 3737 Angus: Another extension was granted related to work safe issues. Next deadline is Feb. 16, 2018.
- Heritage presentation will occur when the Senior Heritage Planner position has been filled.

Project Updates:

- 1102 Wolfe - Application received for a new house.
- 1203 Matthews - Application received for a conservation proposal.
- 1588 Laurier - Application received for a conservation proposal.
- 3775 Angus – Application received for a new house.
- 1677 W King Edward Ave – Application received for a new house.

The Panel considered one application for presentation

Address:	3809 Osler St
Description:	Conservation Proposal
Review:	First
Architect:	Eric Lee, Victoria Eric Design
Delegation:	Ying Shi, Victoria Eric Design

EVALUATION: SUPPORT with Recommendations (7 in favour, 0 abstentions, 1 against)

Applicant's Introductory Comments:

This is a conservation proposal for an addition to the north and east side of this existing building. The addition is setback so that the original form (Osler St.) remains dominant. The main design approach was to respect and retain the existing architecture. The client wanted to bring the front door forward, and as a result the stairs were shifted and the porte cochere was also pulled out. The existing access points off Osler will remain. The new parking area will be screened with proposed hedges. There are existing hedges as well on the City property side, with the proposal to relocate them back to the property to allow for a new stone post with gate.

Landscape:

The neighbourhood already has a number of mature trees. The approach was to maintain the landscaping character of the neighbourhood. The existing hedge will be relocated back to the property line to build a stone and metal fence. Additionally, the proposal includes low shrubbery, perennials, bird friendly species and foundational plating around the building with a combination of evergreens and perennials. The site will also have perennials in the front area and each entrance area.

Planning Comments:

This conservation application proposes revisions and additions to an existing Arts and Crafts style house built in 1924. The site is approximately 100'x100' located on the southwest corner of Balfour Ave. and Osler St. There is an existing circular driveway along Osler and parking access is from Balfour Ave. Due to the existing house location and neighbouring trees, the addition is proposed on north and east facades. A new porte cochere is proposed and parking location to allow maneuvering.

Character defining elements of the existing house include:

- Corner location and significant setback from the street.
- Residential form, scale and massing as expressed by its 2 ½ storey height with full basement and hipped roof structure, featuring a front-gabled wall dormer on the front north, and south elevations; a shed roof dormer on the rear elevation; rectangular, shed roof bay window and a flat-roofed porte cochere.
- Wood-frame construction, featuring stucco-cladding and wooden trim.
- Arts and Crafts style details, such as half-timbering detail in the gable-ends; wooden triangular and scroll-cut brackets; porte cochere with open soffits and tapered columns; arched, recessed front entryway, accessed by wooden stairs; and wooden trim elements including exposed rafter tails, bellyband and planter boxes.

- Variety of window, including original, wooden double-hung assemblies, double-hung tripartite assemblies, and leaded glass assemblies.
- Original wooden front door assembly with central light and side lights, featuring leaded and stained glass, and wooden paneled rear elevation door with glazing.
- Two internal chimneys and
- Associated mature landscape features including a semi-circular driveway.

Questions to Panel:

1. Are the additions visually compatible with, subordinate to, yet distinguishable from the existing building in particular the porte cochere?
2. General commentary on the success of the architectural and landscape design proposals as they relate to the expectations of the First Shaughnessy guidelines?

The applicant then took questions from the panel.

Panel Commentary:

The preservation of this arts and crafts house is appreciated. The appearance on the North and East sides are important due to visibility of the corner lot. The addition on the North side and set back is nicely done. The replicated double hung windows are also appreciated. The vertical patterning of the new chimney on the North doesn't fit the style of the heritage house (too strong and contemporary). The original design of the porte cochere should be preserved and replicated as it is a noted character defining element. The scale of the heritage tapered columns should remain as the proposed new design for columns is bulked up and too contemporary. In keeping within the original Arts and Crafts style of this historic house, the proposed granite stone base is not appropriate, as the original design did not have a tri-partite expression. Can't support adding a horizontal light or window above the original front door and two sidelights, as that would change the character of the front façade. The railings should be wrought iron, and the landscape plan needs more filigree, screening, layering trees and planting.

The proposal is respectful to the trees of this site. The landscape is not complying with the First Shaughnessy design guidelines. Filigree and transition is needed at the street interface as well as canopy trees in the front yard. Be aware that planting does not cover basement window. Permeable patio would be beneficial for the family.

This is a challenging and small site. It is challenging to add the amount of square footage the applicant is proposing and deliver it in a different way. The front elevation on Osler Street is problematic due to the porte cochere being bulked up and the grading changes. The house has a humility to it which has been lost in the process. The cut granite on the foundation changes the character of the house. The landscaping is not quite developed to what's expected in the First Shaughnessy area. Appreciate all the aspects and consideration for the retention just has to be taken a little further in terms of the form.

It is a nice addition, making it the most substantial looking house. Appreciate bringing down the driveway to the front door, makes it more elegant.

This is a difficult project. Concerned the trees will create a large amount of shade. Also there is not much room for a nice garden.

The house and idea of a colorful front door are appreciated. The outdoor space is very bare and not representative of a First Shaughnessy house. The access to the deck is not as grand as it should be and the usage to be restricted. Suggest another access to the garden or the southwest corner.

The previous member comments are echoed. The landscaping plan is very spartan. There is no defined outdoor usable space. Unclear why there is granite to make a tri-partite expression in a house that does not have a tri-partite expression.

Integrating the new addition with the existing house is successful. There is not enough space for kids to play however acknowledge it is a small and challenging site.

Front façade could better reflect the original house. Access to the backyard does not seem inviting. Features such as a deck off the kitchen can be more welcoming.

Chair Summary:

Preservation of the arts and crafts expression is appreciated and the addition is generally supported. The front façade should be in keeping with the original in particular, the porte cochere and columns. The horizontal lights above the front door should be deleted and adding a stone base is not needed as the tri-partite expression is not part of the original house. Ensure the front windows of the basement do not detract from the original look of the front façade. Review the back entrance and how it accesses the car and garden space. Outdoor space is needed. The landscaping is a concern as it is not developed per the First Shaughnessy guidelines filigree and layered planting. Check with an arborist about putting in granite walls along the front and side to ensure will not harm present trees. Ensure wrought iron is being used throughout. Clarify the driveway was cobblestone or concrete. Reconsider chimney design as it is not keeping with historical look

Applicant's Response:

The applicant thanked the panel for their comments. Landscape will research the First Shaughnessy design guidelines and bylaws.