



VANCOUVER HERITAGE COMMISSION

MINUTES

May 27, 2013

A meeting of the Vancouver Heritage Commission was held on Monday, May 27, 2013, at 11:05 am, in the Strathcona Meeting Room, Subground, Vancouver City Hall.

**PRESENT:** Richard Keate, Chair  
David Cuan  
Michael Kluckner  
Orville Lim  
Joel Massey  
Anthony Norfolk  
Jenny Sandy  
Jon Stovell

**ABSENT** Shelley Bruce (Leave of Absence)  
Terry Brunette (Leave of Absence)  
Lihua Livia Huang (Leave of Absence)  
Kim Maust, Vice-Chair (Leave of Absence)

**ALSO PRESENT:** Commissioner John Coupar, Vancouver Park Board  
Councillor Heather Deal,  
Marco D'Agostini, Senior Heritage Planner, Heritage Group  
(Staff Liaison)

**CITY CLERK'S OFFICE:** Pat Boomhower, Meeting Coordinator

**Approval of Leave**

MOVED by Jenny Sandy  
SECONDED by Michael Kluckner

THAT the Vancouver Heritage Commission approve leaves of absence for Shelley Bruce, Terry Brunette, Lihua Livia Huang, and Kim Maust for this meeting.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

**Approval of Minutes**

MOVED by Anthony Norfolk  
SECONDED by Orville Lim

THAT the minutes of the meeting held on April 29, 2013, be approved.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

1. Business Arising from the Minutes

None.

2. Conservation Review

(a) 231 E. Pender Street  
DE416681  
M

Applicant: John Bingham, Architect, Bingham Hill Architects  
David Porte, Developer, Porte Development Corp.

Staff: Zlatan Jankovic, Heritage Planner

Issues:

- (i) Compliance of the proposed new development with the HA-1 Design Guidelines and the Chinatown character;
- (ii) Conservation strategy for the service station building;
- (iii) The strategy to address the mural loss

Staff outlined the application and introduced the owner.

Messrs. Bingham and Porte provided an overview and responded to questions.

MOVED by Michael Kluckner  
SECONDED by Jenny Sandy

THAT the Vancouver Heritage Commission supports the development application for 231 East Pender Street (DE416681) as presented at the May 27, 2013, meeting, and further recommends:

- retention of the unequal front façade widths,
- design development of the southwest corner to make it a stronger element,
- design development of the west lane elevation, specifically including centering the garage doors on the elevation and reflecting the south façade and roof line of the original building,
- consideration of stepping back the terrace at the central bay on the 8th floor of the front façade to make the central bay read like a lower building,
- and, where feasible, reuse of the original garage doors on the west façade rather than replication.

CARRIED  
(Orville Lim opposed)

\* \* \* \* \*

*The Commission recessed at 11:56 am to allow the models to be moved and reconvened at 12:10 pm with the same members present.*

\* \* \* \* \*

(b) 1920 SW Marine Drive, Casa Mia  
VHR A  
Rezoning Application

Applicant: Stuart Howard, Stuart Howard Architects  
Don Luxton, Donald Luxton & Associates

Staff: Marco D'Agostini, Senior Heritage Planner  
Grant Miller, Rezoning Planner

Issues:

- (i) Statement of Significance and Conservation Plan;
- (ii) Overall proposal and compatibility of the new addition with the heritage building

The Chair outlined the process for the meeting and the Commission's role for the many observers attending.

Staff and applicant team reviewed the application and provided an update since the April 16, 2012, VHC meeting, with regard to the proposal to rezone the site for the development of a 92 bed Community Care Facility - Class B (long term care), retention and conversion of Casa Mia, and development of a new 3-storey addition with underground parking and loading facilities replacing the existing garage. They also responded to questions.

MOVED by Michael Kluckner  
SECONDED by Anthony Norfolk

THAT the Vancouver Heritage Commission does not support the rezoning application for Casa Mia (1920 SW Marine Drive) due to:

- i) the scale of the proposed new building, which dominates the heritage building,
- ii) the poorly resolved connection between the old and new parts of the site,
- iii) the loss of estate character in the neighbourhood,
- iv) the institutional nature of the design of the new building,
- v) the loss of the garage, and
- vi) the potential loss of some interior details in the proposed designated areas, especially in the bathrooms.

amended

The Commission requested to separate the components of the motion for the vote.

AMENDMENT MOVED by Jon Stovell  
SECONDED by Anthony Norfolk

THAT the following be added:

- A. THAT the Vancouver Heritage Commission supports the restoration and retention of Casa Mia.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

MOVED by Michael Kluckner  
SECONDED by Anthony Norfolk

THAT the following with regard to scale, connection and loss of estate character be paragraph B:

THAT VHC does not support the rezoning application for Casa Mia (1920 SW Marine Drive) as presented on May 27, 2013, due to:

- the scale of the proposed new building, which dominates the heritage building,
- the poorly resolved connection between the old and new parts of the site, and
- the loss of estate character in the neighbourhood.

CARRIED  
(Joel Massey and Jon Stovell opposed)

AMENDMENT MOVED by Jenny Sandy  
SECONDED by Anthony Norfolk

THAT the following added to bullet (iv) to read:

FURTHER THAT the VHC does not support the proposal because of the institutional nature of the design of the new building which is not compatible with the National Guidelines;

CARRIED  
(David Cuan, Joel Massey and Jon Stovell opposed)

AMENDMENT MOVED by Anthony Norfolk  
SECONDED by Richard Keate

THAT the following be added to bullet (v) to read:

AND FURTHER THAT the VHC does not support the proposal because of the loss of the garage.

CARRIED  
(Joel Massey and Jon Stovell opposed)

AMENDMENT MOVED by Jenny Sandy  
SECONDED by Anthony Norfolk

THAT the following be added to bullet (vi) to read:

FURTHER THAT the VHC does not support the proposal because of the potential loss of interior details in the proposed designated areas, especially in the bathrooms.

LOST  
(David Cuan, Michael Kluckner, Joel Massey and Jon Stovell opposed)

AMENDMENT MOVED by Michael Kluckner  
SECONDED by Jenny Sandy

THAT the following be added as C:

THAT the Vancouver Heritage Commission refer the updated Statement of Significance (SoS) to the Commission's Statement of Significance/Vancouver Heritage Register Subcommittee for further examination and comment.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

AMENDMENT MOVED by Richard Keate  
SECONDED by Orville Lim

THAT the following be added as D:

THAT the VHC commends the applicant for the restoration and maintenance of the existing Casa Mia house.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

FINAL MOTION AS ADOPTED

- A. THAT the Vancouver Heritage Commission (VHC) supports the restoration and retention of Casa Mia.
- B. THAT VHC does not support the rezoning application for 1920 SW Marine Drive as presented on May 27, 2013, due to:
  - the scale of the proposed new building, which dominates the heritage building,
  - the poorly resolved connection between the old and new parts of the site, and
  - the loss of estate character in the neighbourhood;

FURTHER THAT the VHC does not support the proposal because of the institutional nature of the design of the new building which is not compatible with the National Guidelines;

AND FURTHER THAT the VHC does not support the proposal because of the loss of the garage.

- C. THAT the Vancouver Heritage Commission refer the updated Statement of Significance (SoS) for Casa Mia (1920 SW Marine Drive) to the Commission's SoS/Vancouver Heritage Register Subcommittee for further examination and comment.
- D. THAT the VHC commends the applicant for the restoration and maintenance of the existing Casa Mia house.

(c) Heritage Program Review

As follow-up to the motion passed by City Council on May 15, 2013, staff sought Commission's input as to how members would like to be involved in the work for the report back to Council on:

- The role of the City in retaining or protecting privately-owned heritage buildings;
- Existing heritage retention programs and information on how they are performing;
- The use of deconstruction, both to preserve heritage features and divert waste from the landfill;
- How heritage is defined for the purposes of these programs;
- Potential improvements to these programs, based on best practices in other cities.

Councillor Deal provided an update on the Heritage Registry Agreement program and density bank update received by Council, potential tools available, and upcoming cultural mapping, and along with Marco D'Agostini, Senior Heritage Planner, responded to questions.

Following discussion regarding budget, Park Board buildings, Provincial legislation, heritage-related density bonuses, cultural and economic value, and renovation processes, the Commission considered holding a workshop.

Staff Liaison will bring an update to the next VHC meeting to assist in determining whether to have a workshop. Jon Stovell, Joel Massey, and Commissioner Coupar will bring developer, residential and Park Board land and building examples, respectively.

3. Sub-committee Reports

a) *SoS/VHR Sub-Committee*

Hugh McLean, Heritage Planning Analyst, reviewed the Statement of Significance/Vancouver Heritage Register Subcommittee report dated May 6, 2013 (*distributed - on file*).

MOVED by Michael Kluckner  
SECONDED by Jon Stovell

THAT the Vancouver Heritage Commission supports adding the following to the Vancouver Heritage Register as B-listings:

- 2806 West 38<sup>th</sup> Avenue, Butterfield House
- 1160 East Georgia Street, Pastinsky House

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

b) *Heritage Awards Sub-Committee*

The Chair requested any members who are unable to attend the Heritage Awards event being held later that day to let him know as soon as possible due to the limited number of seats.

4. **New Business**

(a) *Sign By-law Review Committee*

The City's Sign By-law Review Committee is looking for a VHC representative to their next consultation which has sessions at various times between June 3 - 5, 2013. Orville Lim and Jon Stovell plan to attend.

**Adjournment**

MOVED by Richard Keate  
SECONDED by Anthony Norfolk

THAT this meeting be adjourned.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

**Next Meeting:**

DATE: June 17, 2013  
TIME: 11:00 am  
PLACE: Strathcona Meeting Room  
Subground, Vancouver City Hall

The Commission adjourned at 2:03 pm.

\* \* \* \* \*