



VANCOUVER HERITAGE COMMISSION

MINUTES

SEPTEMBER 14, 2015

A meeting of the Vancouver Heritage Commission was held on Monday, September 14, 2015, at 11 am, in the Town Hall Meeting Room, Main Floor, Vancouver City Hall.

- PRESENT:** Richard Keate, Chair
Terry Brunette
Jan Fialkowski
Michael Kluckner
Anthony Norfolk
Julia Hulbert*
Jenny Sandy
- ABSENT:** Joel Massey (Leave of Absence)
Mollie Massie (Leave of Absence)
Kim Maust, Vice-Chair (Sick Leave)
Jon Stovell
- ALSO PRESENT:** Councillor Heather Deal, Vancouver City Council
Trustee Penny Noble, Vancouver School Board
Marco D'Agostini, Senior Heritage Planner
- CITY CLERK'S OFFICE:** Nicole Ludwig, Meeting Coordinator

* Denotes absence for a portion of the meeting.

Leave of Absence Requests

MOVED by Commissioner Norfolk
SECONDED by Commission Sandy

THAT the Vancouver Heritage Commission approve leaves of absence for Joel Massey and Mollie Massie for this meeting.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY
(Commissioner Hulbert absent for the vote)

* * * * *

At this point in the proceedings the Commission agreed to deal with Approval of Motions as the next item of business. For ease of reference, the minutes are recorded in the same order as listed on the Agenda.

* * * * *

Approval of Minutes

MOVED by Commissioner Norfolk
SECONDED by Commissioner Sandy

THAT the minutes of the Vancouver Heritage Commission of the meeting held on July 6, 2015, were approved.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

Approval of Motions

On July 27, 2015, Commission members received presentations regarding the projects noted below, and prepared recommendations for consideration at the regular Vancouver Heritage Commission meeting on September 14, 2015.

a. 151-157 Water Street

MOVED by Commissioner Kluckner
SECONDED by Commissioner Norfolk

THAT the Vancouver Heritage Commission support the proposal to redevelop 151-157 Water Street as presented to Commission members on July 27, 2015, noting the following:

- the two-stage setback is acceptable;
- north side (rear elevation) is well done;
- dark steel detailing on the top level is generally acceptable;
- heritage conservation plan is supported;
- the canopy as presented is supported;
- the balance of solids to voids in the proposed addition should be reconsidered to ensure compatibility with the historic buildings.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY
(Commissioner Hulbert absent for the vote)

b. 1170 Barclay Street

MOVED by Commissioner Kluckner
SECONDED by Commissioner Norfolk

THAT the Vancouver Heritage Commission does not support the proposal to redevelop 1170 Barclay Street as presented to Commission members on July 27, 2015, expressing the following concerns:

- the ceiling heights in the new upper floors lead to excessive height of the addition and contribute to an overbearing quality of the addition vis-à-vis the heritage building;

- increasing the setback to the addition would mitigate the impact of it on the heritage building;
- there is a lack of heritage retention in the rehabilitation of the existing apartment building;
- the design of the partial third storey addition adds to the sense that only the heritage façade is being retained;
- the use of replacement vinyl windows in the heritage portion is unacceptable.

FURTHER THAT the Vancouver Heritage Commission requests the applicant resubmit a new proposal.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY
(Commissioner Hulbert absent for the vote)

c. 458 East 10th Avenue

MOVED by Commissioner Kluckner
SECONDED by Commissioner Norfolk

THAT the Vancouver Heritage Commission enthusiastically support the proposal to renovate the existing building and construct a new infill at 458 East 10th Avenue as presented to Commission members on July 27, 2015, noting the following:

- the applicant consider wood shingles rather than duroid for the roof.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

1. Business Arising from the Minutes

None.

2. Conservation Review

**(a) 800 Robson Street - Robson Square
DE418434
VHR 'A'**

Applicants:

- Doug Hamming, Architect, Stantec Architecture
- Robert Lemon, Architect, Heritage Consultant

Staff:

- Marco D'Agostini, Senior Heritage Planner

Staff and the applicants introduced revisions to the proposal to improve entry and access to Robson Square, including signage and wayfinding, and requested input from the Commission. The applicants also responded to questions.

- (b) 22 East 5th Avenue - Cemco Electrical Factory
DE419206 (HRA and Designation)
VHR 'C' (proposed)

Applicants:

- David Fawley, Owner's Representative
- Nick Bray, Applicant
- Donald Luxton, Donald Luxton and Associates, Inc.

Staff:

- James Boldt, Heritage Planner

Staff and the applicant team presented the application and responded to questions, noting the Urban Design Panel preferred a lower and wider scheme than what was proposed, and requested Commission input on this matter. Staff and the applicant team also responded to questions.

MOVED by Commissioner Brunette
SECONDED by Commissioner Norfolk

THAT the Vancouver Heritage Commission support the application to incorporate the north and east facades for 22 East 5th Avenue (Cemco Electrical Factory) into a new development as presented at its meeting on September 14, 2015, noting the following:

- the setback form of the new building is supported;
- the storefront openings are well-executed and compatible;
- the signage and outside treatment should be subtle so to remain subservient to the heritage building.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

* * * * *

The Commission recessed at 12:15 pm and reconvened at 12:31 pm.

* * * * *

- (c) 3760 Quebec Street - McMillan House
3780 Quebec Street - Heise House
DE418928 / DE 418929 (Designation only)
VHR 'C' (proposed)

Applicant:

- Bradley Dore, applicant
- Andre Lessard, Dewhirst Lessard

Staff:

- James Boldt, Heritage Planner

Staff and the applicants presented the revised Statement of Significance for 3760 and 3780 Quebec Street (McMillan House and Heise House respectively), which was requested by the Commission at its meeting on February 23, 2015. They noted that it will allow for conversion into two units and, in return for heritage designation, strata titling is requested.

MOVED by Commissioner Sandy
SECONDED by Commissioner Norfolk

THAT the Vancouver Heritage Commission support the development permit application to revitalize and subdivide/strata title the houses at 3760 and 3780 Quebec Street (McMillan House and Heise House respectively) as presented at its meeting on September 14, 2015, noting the following:

- the project should retain the original siding if at possible;
- spindles on balconies deck should reflect historic style;
- no vinyl windows or Hardie Shingle should be introduced.

FURTHER THAT the Commission request that the owner consider reinstalling cedar shingles for the roofs.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

(d) 2836 West 14th Avenue - Beer Residence
DE419101 (Designation only)
VHR 'C' (proposed)

Applicant:

- Annaliese Kelly

Staff:

- James Boldt, Heritage Planner

Staff and applicant introduced proposed revisions to the Statement of Significance, as requested by the Vancouver Heritage Commission at its meeting on February 23, 2015, and responded to questions regarding the materials list, windows and the proposed relocation of the front steps.

MOVED by Commissioner Sandy
SECONDED by Commissioner Norfolk

THAT the Vancouver Heritage Commission support application to renovate 2836 West 14th Avenue (The Beer Residence), as presented at its meeting on September 14, 2015, with the following suggestions:

- the owner investigate the rehabilitation of all the house's existing windows;
- the owner consider retaining the stair and porch post configuration as existing.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

3. Heritage Action Plan Update

Staff:

- Marco D'Agostini, Senior Heritage Planner
- Tanis Knowles Yarnell, Heritage Planner

Staff provided an update on the Heritage Action plan, noting the public hearing for the First Shaughnessy Heritage Conservation Area is reconvening on Tuesday, September 15, 2015.

Staff also noted work has been done on the Heritage Register and the recommendations for adding to the register will go through a peer review process prior to bringing an amended evaluation approach to the Statement of Significance Subcommittee.

4. Statement of Significance and Vancouver Heritage Register

Hugh McLean, Heritage Planner, presented the Statement of Significance and Vancouver Heritage Register Subcommittee report from their meeting on August 31, 2015, including issues with the following projects:

- Granville Street (Robson Street to Drake Street) Context Statement has components missing;
- 1500 West Georgia is suggested as a Heritage A Listing, but the Statement of Significance requires revisions;
- Statement of Significance for 2808 East 34th Avenue (BK Grocery) requires extensive editing;
- 3750 Prince Edward Street is proposed as a Heritage B Listing and the Statement of Significance requires revisions.

Following discussion, it was

MOVED by Commissioner Kluckner
SECONDED by Commissioner Norfolk

- A. THAT the Vancouver Heritage Commission request the Context Statement for Granville Street (Robson Street to Drake Street) be referred back to the consultants for revisions.
- B. THAT the Vancouver Heritage Commission support adding 1500 West Georgia Street (Crown Life Place) to the Vancouver Heritage Register as an A listing.
- C. THAT the Vancouver Heritage Commission request that the Statements of Significance for the properties listed below be referred back to the consultants for revisions, and where necessary, to complete revisions to the Vancouver Heritage Register Evaluations:
 - 1500 West Georgia Street (Crown Life Place);
 - 2308 East 34th Avenue - BK Grocery;
 - 3750 Prince Edward Street.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

5. New Business

a. Shannon Mews

Commission members expressed an interest in seeing Shannon Mews. Staff agreed to contact the owners to arrange a viewing closer to the completion date of the project.

ADJOURNMENT

MOVED by Commissioner Sandy
SECONDED by Commissioner Brunette

THAT the meeting be adjourned.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

Next Meeting:

DATE: October 5, 2015
TIME: 11 am
PLACE: Town Hall Meeting Room
Main Floor, Vancouver City Hall

The Committee adjourned at 1:33 pm.

* * * * *