



VANCOUVER HERITAGE COMMISSION

MINUTES

JUNE 27, 2016

A meeting of the Vancouver Heritage Commission was held on Monday, June 27, 2016, at 11 am, in Town Hall Meeting Room, Main Floor, Vancouver City Hall.

PRESENT: Richard Keate, Chair
Jan Fialkowski
Lori Kozub Hodgkinson
Michael Kluckner*
Mollie Massie
Kim Maust, Vice-Chair
Anthony Norfolk
Jenny Sandy*
Cassandra Sclauzero*

ABSENT: Julia Hulbert (Leave of Absence)
Joel Massey (Leave of Absence)

ALSO PRESENT: Councillor Heather Deal, Council Liaison
Commissioner Casey Crawford, Park Board Liaison
Trustee Penny Noble, School Board Liaison
Marco D'Agostini, Senior Heritage Planner, Staff Liaison

CITY CLERK'S OFFICE: Tina Hildebrandt, Meeting Coordinator

* Denotes absence for a portion of the meeting.

Leave of Absence Requests

MOVED by Commissioner Jenny Sandy
SECONDED by Commissioner Michael Kluckner

THAT the Vancouver Heritage Commission approve leaves of absence for Commissioners Julia Hulbert and Joel Massey for this meeting.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY
(Commissioner Cassandra Sclauzero absent for the vote)

MOVED by Commissioner Michael Kluckner
SECONDED by Commissioner Anthony Norfolk

THAT the Vancouver Heritage Commission approve a leave of absence for Commissioner Jenny Sandy for the July 18, 2016, meeting

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY
(Commissioner Cassandra Sclauzero absent for the vote)

Approval of Minutes

MOVED by Commissioner Anthony Norfolk
SECONDED by Commissioner Mollie Massie

THAT the Vancouver Heritage Commission approve the minutes from the meeting held June 6, 2016, as circulated.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY
(Commissioner Cassandra Sclauzero absent for the vote)

1. Business Arising from the Minutes

None

2. Conservation Review

- (a) **33 W. Cordova - DE419722**
Stanley Hotel VHR "B", M and New Fountain Hotel VHR "B", M

Issues:

- demolition of two designated heritage buildings in a designated historic area, loss of original historic fabric and associated historic character
- proposed built form and massing, 8.57 FSR and the height of 110 ft (HA-2 District Schedule limits height to 75 ft)
- impact on Gastown, municipally and nationally designated historic district
- compatibility of the proposed design with HA-2 Design Guidelines
- compatibility of the proposed night club use and its potential impact on the community
- "facadism" as a redevelopment tool, especially given that retained facades are not fully functionally integrated with new construction above ground floor
- historic storefronts are proposed to be replaced rather than preserved or restored
- removal of cornices in good condition and replacement with simplified "interpretations" of originals (Stanley Conservation Plan, Page 18)
- removal of historic fabric of a pediment wall, generally in good condition, (see conservation plan, page 18)
- is the proposed façade conservation effort eligible for the heritage façade grant through the City's Heritage Façade Rehabilitation Program (note: one of the HFRP eligibility criteria is that the proposed work "must comply with all heritage conservation standards")?

Applicants: Henriquez Partners Architects, Gregory Henriquez and Rui Nunes
Provincial Rental Housing Corporation, Mathew Brodie, Owner
Westbank Projects Corp., Ian Gillespie, Developer
Donald Luxton & Associates Inc., Don Luxton, Heritage Consultant

Staff: Zlatan Jankovic, Heritage Planner
Paul Cheng, Development Planner

Staff and the applicants reviewed the application and responded to questions.

MOVED by Commissioner Kim Maust
SECONDED by Commissioner Michael Kluckner

THAT the Vancouver Heritage Commission, while respecting the work of both City staff and the applicant in their incredible effort to propose a project that addresses City policies, does not support the application to redevelop 33 W. Cordova with an 11 storey mixed use building with 214 dwelling units (80 non-market rental and 134 market rental) on the heritage designated site, which includes only partial retention of two heritage facades;

FURTHER THAT the Commission wishes to draw Council's attention to the proposed loss of two significant buildings in Gastown's Historic District, noting that the policy to ensure the retention of 80 SRO units is at competition to Gastown's status of a national historic district, and that the problem with the project is due to the inflexibility of policy vis-a-vis its use;

FURTHER THAT the Commission encourages that the applicant look at all opportunities to preserve the building with a more sensitive built form in keeping with the Gastown Heritage District and the historic nature of the community; and

FURTHER THAT the Commission recommends that Council consider other strategies for greater preservation such as allowing for market residential and/or allowing for density bank transfers for this kind of project.

CARRIED
(Commissioner Cassandra Sclauzero opposed)

* * * * *

The Commission recessed at 12:51 pm, and reconvened at 1:05 pm.

* * * * *

**(b) 5400 Cartier Street (Vancouver College)
Pre-Application
VHR 'B'**

Issue: Replacement of existing historic structures

Staff: James Boldt, Heritage Planner
Timothy Potter, Development Planner

Applicant: Mark Ostry, Architect
Milos Begovic, Architect

Staff and the applicants reviewed the application and, along with Donald Luxton, Heritage Consultant, responded to questions.

MOVED by Commissioner Kim Maust
SECONDED by Commissioner Cassandra Sclauzero

THAT the Vancouver Heritage Commission, while regretting the total loss of the McCormick heritage facade and the partial loss of the heritage fabric of the Lannon

facade, generally supports the application for 5400 Cartier Street (Vancouver College), including the adaptive reuse of the Lannon Hall facade but asks that a conservation plan be circulated to the Commission for comment;

FURTHER THAT the Commission recommends that further design consideration be given to the two-story flat brick wall extension.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

(Commissioners Michael Kluckner and Jenny Sandy absent for the vote)

**(c) 5471 Wales Street - Cantone Residence
DE418819 - Designation By-law
VHR 'B'**

Issue: Conservation Plan
Compatibility of new development

Staff: James Boldt, Heritage Planner

Applicant: Sandra Moore, Architect

Staff and the applicant reviewed the application and responded to questions.

MOVED by Commissioner Richard Keate
SECONDED by Commissioner Mollie Massie

THAT the Vancouver Heritage Commission supports the application for 5471 Wales Street - Cantone Residence, and commends the applicant for the compatible infill buildings;

FURTHER THAT the Commission urges the Chief Building Official to respect the integrity of the heritage house by not requiring the applicant to change the consistent finish to non-combustible hardy plank.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

(Commissioners Michael Kluckner, Jenny Sandy and Cassandra Sclauzero absent for the vote)

**3. Statement of Significance and Vancouver Heritage
Register Subcommittee Report**

Staff: Hugh McLean, Heritage Planning Analyst

The Staff Liaison reviewed the Report from the Statement of Significance and Vancouver Heritage Register Subcommittee meeting of June 13, 2016.

MOVED by Commissioner Anthony Norfolk
SECONDED by Commissioner Jan Fialkowski

THAT the Vancouver Heritage Commission request that the Statements of Significance for the following buildings be referred back to the consultants for revisions:

- 1312 West 57th Avenue - Bell-Irving Residence;

- 1790 Angus Drive - Salsbury Residence;
- 1102 Commercial Drive - Florida Grocery;
- 555 West Hastings Street - Spencer's Department Store;
- 675 West Hastings Street - Royal Bank Building;
- 6633 Macdonald Street - Reginald and Aileen Symes Residence; and
- 8901 Stanley Park Drive - Stanley Park Sports Pavilion.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

(Commissioners Michael Kluckner, Jenny Sandy and Cassandra Sclauzero absent for the vote)

4. New Business

None

ADJOURNMENT

MOVED by Commissioner Mollie Massie
SECONDED by Commissioner Kim Maust

THAT this meeting be adjourned.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

(Commissioners Michael Kluckner, Jenny Sandy and Cassandra Sclauzero absent for the vote)

Next Meeting:

DATE: Monday, July 18, 2016
TIME: 11 am
PLACE: Town Hall Meeting Room
Main Floor, Vancouver City Hall

The Commission adjourned at 2:26 pm.

* * * * *