



VANCOUVER HERITAGE COMMISSION

MINUTES

September 30, 2019

A meeting of the Vancouver Heritage Commission was held on Monday, September 30, 2019, at 11:00 am, in the Town Hall Meeting Room, Main Floor, City Hall.

PRESENT: Michael Kluckner, Chair
Michael Gordon
Denise Jacques
Richard Keate
Doreen Leo
Joel Massey
Mollie Massie
Jenni Pace
Craig Rogers

ABSENT: Jan Fialkowski, Vice-Chair (Leave of Absence)
Janet Leduc (Leave of Absence)

ALSO PRESENT: Councillor Colleen Hardwick, Council Liaison
Commissioner Gwen Giesbrecht, Park Board Liaison
Trustee Estrellita Gonzalez, Vancouver School Board
Liaison
Zlatan Jankovic, Senior Heritage Planner, Staff Liaison
Amber Knowles, Heritage Planner
Hugh McLean, Heritage Planner
Maxine Schleger, Heritage Planning Analyst

CITY CLERK'S OFFICE: Kathy Bengston, Committee Clerk

WELCOME

The Chair acknowledged we are on the unceded territories of the Musqueam, Squamish, and Tsleil-Waututh Nations.

Approval of Minutes

MOVED by Commissioner Jacques
SECONDED by Commisisoner Massie

THAT the Vancouver Heritage Commission approve the Minutes from the meeting of September 9, 2019, as circulated.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

1. Business Arising from the Minutes

None.

2. 1215 West 16th Avenue – Baldwin Residence VHR “B”, Designation DP-2019-00476

Issues:

- Compatibility of infill dwellings with the heritage building
- Conservation approach and consistency between expressed intent and details on drawings
- Support for designation and Conservation Plan

Applicant: Timothy Ankenman – Ankenman Marchand Architects
(timothy@amarchitects.com)
Andre Lessard (dewhirstlessard@shaw.ca)

Staff: Hugh McLean, Heritage Planner
Susan Chang, Development Planner

Staff and the applicant provided an overview of the application and responded to questions.

MOVED by Commissioner Gordon
SECONDED by Commissioner Massey

WHEREAS

1. The Baldwin Residence is a B-listed building on the Vancouver Heritage Register;
2. The architects and consultants have presented a satisfactory conservation plan for it and propose to retain it in situ;
3. The proposal for two infill buildings (Buildings A and C in the presentation) of two units each, and the conversion of the Baldwin Residence into three units, is a conditionally permitted use within the RT-2 Zone;

4. The restrained design of Buildings A and C do not compete with the Arts and Crafts Style of Building B – the Baldwin Residence;
5. The proponent is willing to designate the Baldwin Residence.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT

- A. The Vancouver Heritage Commission conditionally supports the application, including the relaxations sought for the non-conforming height of the Baldwin Residence;
- B. The Commission asks the Applicant for further design development of Building 1, specifically of the projection of Unit 2 in order to reduce its proximity to the front door of the Baldwin Residence and its masking of the main gable of the house's front façade;
- C. The Commission asks the Applicant that efforts be made to move Building 1 further west, reducing the size of its units if necessary, in order to provide more space around the original front façade of the Baldwin Residence;
- D. The Commission asks the Applicant for a rethink of the proposed landscape treatment, noting that an element of the Arts and Crafts style is the relationship of the house to its immediate landscape, and further noting that the stamped concrete patios and hedging pattern conflict with the curve of the roadway and negate any sense of the house's historic siting on its lot; and
- E. The Commission expressed concern about the notation of vinyl windows on Sheet A 200, noting that they do not meet heritage standards, and the amount of below-grade space used only as crawl space, leading to more massing above grade.

CARRIED
(Commissioner Rogers opposed)

* * * * *

The Commission recessed at 12:03 pm and reconvened at 12:13 pm.

* * * * *

**3. 301 E. Hastings
VHR “C”
Pre-Application Workshop**

Applicant: Peg MacDonald, Architect, VIA Architecture
Johnny Jung, Development Manager, BC Housing
John Rimell, Vancouver Coastal Health

Staff: Zlatan Jankovic, Senior Heritage Planner
Ji-Taek Park, Development Planner
Jonathan Borsa, Project Facilitator

Staff and the applicant provided an overview of the application and responded to questions.

Comments from the Commissioners included:

- concern that the Salvation Army's building retention on the site and the Downtown Eastside may create painful memories;
- if 40% of the homeless in Vancouver are Indigenous, did the 60% who are non-Indigenous in the Downtown Eastside feel the same way about the Salvation Army?
- will the proposal be an example of the “cancel culture” – erasing a significant presence from the landscape?
- the Schwachays Lodge as an example of the retention of historic facades and addition of Indigenous architectural reference;
- will the Indigenous-theme culturally safe space work for non-Indigenous people?

* * * * *

The Commission recessed at 1:14 pm and reconvened at 1:17 pm.

* * * * *

4. Update on Heritage Plaque Program and Recent Thefts

Staff provided an update on the Heritage Plaque Program in light of the recent high volume thefts in 2019. Discussion followed, with ideas for a solution.

**5. Statement of Significance and
Vancouver Heritage Register Subcommittee Reports**

Staff reviewed the report from the Statement of Significance and Vancouver Heritage Register Subcommittee meeting held on September 16, 2019, and responded to questions.

MOVED by Commissioner Massie
SECONDED by Commissioner Jacques

THAT the Vancouver Heritage Commission request that the Statements of Significance for the following buildings, be referred back to the consultants for revisions:

- 1925 Whyte Avenue – Harrington;
- 1949 W 57th Avenue – Earle Residence;
- 4479 James Street – Samuel Swann House; and
- 1215 W 16th Avenue – Baldwin Residence.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

6. New Business

a) Vancouver Project Office (VPO) Seismic Projects

Trustee Gonzalez, shared the list of VPO Seismic Projects with Heritage Status.

b) Demolition of Heritage Building

The Chair shared a developer's request seeking assistance from the City to retain the façade of the building destroyed by fire. Staff will contact owner and provide support.

c) Reconciling Colonial and Pre-Colonial Heritage Values

Further discussion and input followed on heritage conservation aspects of colonial and pre-colonial contexts appearing at the Commission meetings lately.

ADJOURNMENT

MOVED by Commissioner Kluckner
SECONDED by Commissioner Massie

THAT this meeting be adjourned.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

Next Meeting:

DATE: Monday, October 21, 2019
TIME: 11:00 am
PLACE: Town Hall Meeting Room
Main Floor, City Hall

The Commission adjourned at 2:03 pm.

* * * * *