



VANCOUVER HERITAGE COMMISSION

MINUTES

OCTOBER 26, 2020

A meeting of the Vancouver Heritage Commission was held on Monday, October 26, 2020, at 11:01 am, via electronic means.

PRESENT: Michael Kluckner, Chair
Paul Giles*
Michael Gordon, Vice-Chair
Michael Kluckner
Joel Massey
Mollie Massie
Jenni Pace
Shirley Shen

ABSENT: Randip Bakshi (Leave of Absence)
Richard Keate
Doreen Leo
Craig Rogers

ALSO PRESENT: Councillor Colleen Hardwick, Council Liaison
Commissioner Gwen Giesbrecht, Park Board Liaison
Trustee Estrellita Gonzalez, School Board Liaison
Zlatan Jankovic, Senior Heritage Planner, Planning, Urban Design and Sustainability (Staff Liaison)
Hugh McLean, Heritage Planner, Planning, Urban Design and Sustainability
Amber Knowles, Heritage Planner, Planning, Urban Design and Sustainability
Maxine Schleger, Heritage Planning Analyst, Planning, Urban Design and Sustainability

CITY CLERK'S OFFICE: Kathy Bengston, Committee Clerk

* Denotes absence for a portion of the meeting

WELCOME

The Chair acknowledged we are on the unceded territories of the Musqueam, Squamish, and Tsleil-Waututh Nations.

Approval of Minutes

MOVED by Commissioner Massie
SECONDED by Commissioner Gordon

THAT the Vancouver Heritage Commission approve the Minutes from the meeting of Monday, October 5, 2020, as circulated.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

Leave of Absence Requests

MOVED by Commissioner Massie
SECONDED by Commissioner Gordon

THAT the Vancouver Heritage Commission approve leaves of absence for Commissioner Bakshi, for today's meeting, and for Commissioner Shen for the November 16, 2020, meeting.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

1. 1685 Nelson St. – Marshall Smith Residence VHR “B” (proposed) DP-2018-00781

An application has been received to retain and rehabilitate the Marshall Smith Residence, a residential building at the corner of Nelson Street and Bidwell Street in the West End. The building is proposed to be added as a “B” listing on the Vancouver Heritage Register. The Marshall Smith Residence is a two-and-a-half storey residential building built in 1908. It is valued for its Colonial Revival Style with Edwardian features, its evolution reflecting that of the development of the West End, and as one of the few remaining large residences of the West End.

The proposal is for the construction of a modern addition to the southeast of the heritage house. The development will include four units within the heritage house and its addition. Further proposed work includes replacing some existing windows with in-kind wood windows, reconstruction of the concrete-block foundation with addition of a below grade garage, and retaining existing heritage cladding and features, replacing in-kind where needed.

The heritage building will be added to the Vancouver Heritage Register as a ‘B’ listing and receive long-term protection through a Restoration Covenant that will both ensure the restoration strategy for the building and also require issuance of a Heritage Alteration Permit for any changes to the exterior. This Covenant will be registered on title in perpetuity. The development is within the permitted conditional FSR of the RM-5A zoning, but is seeking a site area relaxation to 55% from 50% maximum permitted and a side yard setback relaxation to 2.1m from 2.4m minimum permitted.

Issues:

- Compatibility of addition
- Interventions to the heritage building: reconstructing foundation, addition of garage

Applicant: Alexandre Ravkov, Project Designer, Alexandre Ravkov Inc.
John Atkin, Heritage Consultant, John Atkin History & Research
Evan Sangha, Owner, Miraval Properties Inc.

Staff: Amber Knowles, Heritage Planner, Planning, Urban Design and Sustainability
Kevin Spaans, Development Planner, Planning, Urban Design and Sustainability

Staff and the applicant provided an overview of the application and responded to questions.

MOVED by Commissioner Gordon
SECONDED by Commissioner Massey

WHEREAS

1. The building known as the Marshall Smith Residence is proposed to be added to the heritage register as a “B” on the Vancouver Heritage Register; and
2. A proposal has been received for the construction of a modern addition on its southeast corner; and
3. The proposed work will retain existing heritage cladding and features, as well as replacement of existing windows with in-kind wood windows and the reconstruction of its concrete block foundation; and
4. The proponents seek a site area relaxation to 55% and side yard setback relaxation to 2.1 metres.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED

- A. THAT the Vancouver Heritage Commission (the “Commission”) supports the project in principle, including the relaxations in 4) above, and the Conservation Plan as presented, especially supporting the items in 3) above.
- B. THAT the Commission supports the addition of the heritage building to the heritage register.
- C. THAT the Commission requests design development on the project, specifically noting:
 - a. the incompatibility of the materials and colours of the western 1/3 (the “dormer”) of the addition and the awkward transition from it to the historic building;
 - b. window design and the wall-window ratio on the eastern two-thirds of the addition compared with the heritage building;
 - c. the use of aluminum windows on the addition;
 - d. the lining up of the floor levels between the addition and the historic building.

- D. THAT the Commission regrets the lack of a detailed presentation of the design of the infill building, including a colour rendering and a perspective drawing that would better enable Commissioners to evaluate it.

CARRIED
(Commissioner Giles opposed)

2. Heritage Policies – Overview

The Commission received and had an opportunity to respond to the Heritage Policy document presented by staff.

3. New Business

Postponed to next regular meeting.

ADJOURNMENT

MOVED by Commissioner Massie
SECONDED by Commissioner Massey

THAT this meeting be adjourned.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY
(Commissioner Giles absent for the vote)

Next Meeting:

DATE: Monday, November 16, 2020
TIME: 11:00 am
PLACE: WebEx Online

The Commission adjourned at 1:06 pm.

* * * * *