

File No. 04-1000-20-2016-375

November 10, 2016

s.22(1)

Dear s.22(1)

Re: Request for Access to Records under the Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy Act (the "Act")

I am responding to your request of October 7, 2016 for:

All records about the concept, design, wording, budgeting, procurement, approvals, production, manufacture, delivery and payment for the West End Sex Workers' Memorial near St. Paul's Anglican Church.

All responsive records are attached. Some information in the records has been severed, (blacked out), under s.12(3)(b) of the Act. You can read or download this section here: http://www.bclaws.ca/EPLibraries/bclaws_new/document/ID/freeside/96165_00

Under section 52 of the Act you may ask the Information & Privacy Commissioner to review any matter related to the City's response to your request. The Act allows you 30 business days from the date you receive this notice to request a review by writing to: Office of the Information & Privacy Commissioner, info@oipc.bc.ca or by phoning 250-387-5629.

If you request a review, please provide the Commissioner's office with: 1) the request number assigned to your request (#04-1000-20-2016-375); 2) a copy of this letter; 3) a copy of your original request for information sent to the City of Vancouver; and 4) detailed reasons or grounds on which you are seeking the review.

Please do not hesitate to contact the Freedom of Information Office at foi@vancouver.ca if you have any questions.

Yours truly,



Barbara J. Van Fraassen, BA
Director, Access to Information
City Clerk's Department, City of Vancouver

Encl.

:kt

January 19, 2016

Dear Residents:

RE: Installation of lamp post at 1130 Jervis Street

Please be advised that in the spring of 2016 a decorative lamp post with small plaque will be installed on the boulevard adjacent to St. Paul's Anglican Church at 1130 Jervis Street.

The lamp post will serve as a memorial to commemorate the lives of sex workers during the early 1980's in Vancouver's West End who were displaced by harmful municipal by-law amendments and broader societal discrimination. This project is being completed in partnership with the West End Sex Workers' Memorial Committee. You can find out more information about the project, committee and the history of sex work in the West End at <http://www.westendsexworkhistory.com/>.

Due to historical stigmatization and marginalization of sex workers in Vancouver, the City has taken an active role to increase the health and safety of sex workers and address the impacts of sex work on communities with a balanced, inclusive and equitable approach. You can find more information at <http://vancouver.ca/people-programs/Health-and-safety-for-sex-workers.aspx>. The work of the West End Sex Workers' Memorial Committee is directly aligned with Council's priority to build safe and inclusive communities for all residents, a primary goal in the City of Vancouver's Healthy City Strategy.

The design of the lamp post, is a traditional configuration with a simple black base, a decorative pole, and an anti-glare soft lighting fixture and will lend to the neighbourhood's visual appeal. It will be approximately 10ft in height. (see design rendering)

Should you have any questions about this project, please contact Ty Mistry at 604 871- 6697 or via email to ty.mistry@vancouver.ca by Tuesday, February 2, 2016.

Regards,

Mary Clare Zak
Managing Director, Social Policy & Projects Division





Mayor Gregor Robertson, mayorandcouncil@vancouver.ca
City Councilors
City Manager, Penny Ballem Penny.Ballem@vancouver.ca
Director of Social Policy, Mary Clare Zak MaryClare.Zak@vancouver.ca
Senior Social Planner, Debbie Anderson Eng, Debbie.anderson.eng@vancouver.ca
General Manager, Park Board, Malcolm Bromely Malcolm.bromley@vancouver.ca
Chair, Park Board, John Coupar John.coupar@vancouver.ca

June 22, 2015

**Attention: PART TWO - Request for Meeting with Mayor & City Council:
Redress for Sex Workers Expelled From Vancouver's West End, 1984**

Dear Mayor Gregor Robertson, City Councilors, Penny Ballem, Mary Clare Zak, Debbie Anderson Eng, Malcolm Bromley, and John Coupar:

On July 16, 2014, we – co-founders of the West End Sex Workers Memorial Committee - sent you a 12-page submission outlining our request for financial reparations and a public apology for sex workers who were violently and unjustly expelled from living and working in the city's West End in July 1984. (We have attached our first submission here.) On April 17, 2015, in a follow-up meeting with Mary Clare Zak and Debbie Anderson Eng, both Ms. Zak and Ms. Eng expressed genuine enthusiasm for our initial proposal, and for moving forward to redress a historical wrong. We are writing to request a meeting with the Mayor and City Councilors in July 2015, with a focus on 3 main points:

1) The Case for Financial Reparations & Public Apology

a) In November 1981, city councilors voted to approve an estimated **\$28,000** for the installation of seven mini-parks, five traffic circles, four cement traffic diverters, three traffic islands, laneway lighting, and a cul-de-sac, as outlined in the Department's West End Traffic Plan.¹ As reported by Peter Trask in the *Vancouver Sun*, council members voted to construct these barriers throughout the West End "to deter prostitution-related traffic in the area."

b) Dr. John Lowman, criminologist at Simon Fraser University, published his *Vancouver Field Study of Prostitution* (Working Papers on Pornography and

¹ See City Council & Office of City Fonds, Council Minutes, MCRI (microfilm), vol. 142, "West End Prostitution/Nuisance Problem," p. 4-5, 3 November 1981. City of Vancouver Archives.



Prostitution Report No. 8) for the federal Department of Justice in 1986. In his study, Dr. Lowman found that the “Street Activities Bylaw,” deemed the ‘anti-hooker bylaw’ in the press, was passed by Vancouver’s city councilors, with enforcement beginning on April 6th, 1982. The bylaw stated: ““No person shall, upon any street, sell or offer to sell to another person or purchase or offer to purchase, sexual services.” Fines for on-street solicitation ranged from \$350 to \$2,000. On September 29, 1982, the *Vancouver Sun* reported that the bylaw had “become a lucrative revenue source for the city,” with an “estimated **\$28,000** in fines” collected through bylaw prosecutions.² By October 20th, 1982, the *Vancouver Sun* reported that 506 summonses had been issued under the bylaw. On December 9, 1982, the *Vancouver Sun* reported that the courts were significantly backed up because of the number of bylaw cases. Finally, on January 26, 1983, the Supreme Court of Canada in *Westendorp v. Regina* ruled that the street activities bylaw in Calgary, Alberta, was unconstitutional because it was *ultra vires* of federal jurisdiction. Vancouver’s municipal bylaw was subsequently rescinded and all outstanding charges were dropped. Dr. Lowman discovered that during the nine months that the anti-solicitation bylaw was in effect over 500 charges were laid, with 200 brought to court. While we do not have access to relevant records at the Vancouver Police Department – which could be consulted for corroboration - Lowman makes the convincing case that the fines were illegally administered by (often undercover) police officers, and that the illegal fines levied amounted to significant financial hardship for street-based sex workers who had to work harder to pay them off. On January 29, 1983, *Vancouver Sun* reporter Les Bewley informed Vancouverites that, “Mayor Harcourt and his council will not return the illegally obtained money.”

c) In addition to traffic diverters and illegal fines collected from sex workers and their clients, the former Mayor, Mike Harcourt approved a six-month contract for **\$15,000** (through the Social Planning Department) to hire Gordon Price as the new West End Community Coordinator for the West End Community Advisory Council in October 1983. Up to that point, Price had served as head of the powerful anti-prostitution lobby group, Concerned Residents of the West End (CROWE). Price’s non-tendered city contract to “study the conflict” internal to what he termed a “red-light ghetto” served to advance Mayor Harcourt’s self-described “war on hookers.” While Harcourt’s unethical conflict of interest in appointing Price was exposed by critics at the time, Price was able to leverage his paid influence to achieve CROWE’s ultimate goal: the expulsion of female, male, and trans sex workers from the West End. On July 4th, 1984, Chief Justice of the British Columbia Supreme Court, Allan

² On September 29, 1982, it was reported in the *Vancouver Sun* that the city’s bylaw prosecutor Roland Bouwman estimated that 80 fines of \$350 each (totaling \$28,000) had been paid to date.



McEachern banned “blatant, aggressive disorderly prostitutes” from working in the West End in order to preserve “the peaceful integrity of the community” west of Granville Street.³

This unprecedented series of **city-financed initiatives** supplies empirical evidence of city officials’ anti-prostitution agenda in the early-to-mid 1980s. Civic leaders sought to protect public propriety and property values in the West End at the expense of the human rights of sex workers who worked and lived in this neighbourhood.

2. The Case for a Beautiful, Uplifting Monument in *Jim Deva Plaza*

We commend the role that civic leaders have played in the installation of various Memorials throughout the city of Vancouver. We acknowledge the Komagata Maru monument at Coal Harbour, the AIDS Memorial at Sunset Beach, the Marker of Change at Thornton Park, the Hogan’s Alley Memorial Plaque, and the Heart Has Its Own Memory at Crab Park. Similarly, our West End Sex Workers Memorial, ideally located in the newly named *Jim Deva Plaza* at Bute and Davie Streets, will celebrate the long, rich history of sex workers who called the West End home, from brothel workers at Maxine’s on Bidwell Street in the early 1900s to the hundreds who worked the pimp-free Davie Street stroll from the 1960s to 1984.⁴

In June 2015, we ask the Mayor and councilors for the return of “illegally obtained money” from fines, alongside recognition of unethical spending by civic officials to prevent what Mayor Harcourt called “a hooker takeover” in the West End. Once financial support from Mayor Robertson and city councilors has been secured, consultation will need to follow with interested stakeholders, including Gordon Neighbourhood House, West End Neighbours, Little Sister’s Bookstore, Melriches, Qmunity, Celebrities, Numbers, Fountain Head, Pumpjack, *Xtra*, Dr. Hedy Fry’s office, Rhinestone Phoenix Charity Foundation, WECAN, St. Paul’s Anglican Church (on Jervis St.) and Christ Church Cathedral (on Burrard St). In earlier incarnations, many of these community groups advanced social justice for sexual and gender minorities in the mid-1980s. Beyond the West End, we have the support of local sex workers’ organizations such as PACE Society, Pivot Legal Society, FIRST: feminists advocating for the Decriminalization of Sex Work, Downtown Eastside Sex Workers

³ See A. McEachern, *Attorney General of British Columbia v. Couillard et al.* Judgment 4 July 1948, in *British Columbia Law Reports*, vol. 59, Part I, pp. 102-12. Calgary, Alta: Carswell Legal Publications.

⁴ In June 1984, it was reported during a three-day hearing about the legal injunction that police had identified 350 prostitutes in the West End.



United Against Violence, BC Coalition of Experiential Communities, and Triple-X Workers' Solidarity Association of BC, Hustle, and Boys R Us. In addition, we have the support of the *Georgia Straight*, the *Tyee*, and *Xtra* news outlets.

3. The Case for a Local Design Competition: West End Sex Workers Memorial

Alongside consultation with community stakeholders, we will launch a call for proposals for our West End Sex Workers Memorial, with a focus on students and recent graduates in visual art & design from Emily Carr University, UBC, SFU, and BCIT.⁵ An adjudication committee would then select a winning design. We imagine our memorial to be beautiful and statuesque; it would attract residents and tourists to its powerfully uplifting message of community building, courage, and resilience. To date, we have imagined a wrought iron lamppost, a bronze plaque affixed to the post, and a bronze stiletto-heeled shoe at its base. At the same time, we are open to alternative designs. As sex workers' rights movements grow internationally, from India to Cambodia to New Zealand to Mexico, we know that the time is right to announce publicly, through a majestic West End Memorial, that sex workers were, and are, worthy of collective respect, belonging, and humanity.

We look forward to the opportunity to address the Mayor and City Councilors in July 2015. Please be in touch via email about possible dates. Thank you.

Yours sincerely,

Jamie Lee Hamilton, Tricia.foxx@yahoo.ca
Co-founder, West End Sex Workers Memorial Committee

Becki Ross, Becki.ross@ubc.ca
Co-founder, West End Sex Workers Memorial Committee
Professor, Sociology & Institute for Gender, Race, Sexuality, and Social Justice, UBC

⁵ We are inspired by the story of Maya Lin, a 21-year old undergraduate student at Yale University in 1981, whose design was chosen for a Vietnam Veterans Memorial in Washington, DC.



Mayor Gregor Robertson, mayorandcouncil@vancouver.ca
City Councillors
City Manager, Penny Ballem Penny.Ballem@vancouver.ca
Director of Social Policy, Mary Clare Zak MaryClare.Zak@vancouver.ca
City Hall, Vancouver, BC

July 16, 2014

Attention: Redress for Sex Workers Expelled From Vancouver's West End

Dear Mayor Gregor Robertson, City Councilors, Penny Ballem, and Mary Clare Zak:

As co-founders of the West End Sex Work Memorial Project, we draw your attention to a piece of long-forgotten Vancouver history. Thirty years ago, industrious, community-minded 'hookers on Davie' Street were violently prohibited from both living and working in the West End, their neighbourhood.¹ We believe that these sex workers, as citizens, are long overdue for official truth and reconciliation. Indeed, at a mayoral candidates' meeting in October 2008 at the Anglican Church on Jervis Street in the West End, Jamie Lee Hamilton posed a question to candidates Gregor Robertson and Peter Ladner: "Would you support a public apology to sex workers who were violently expelled from the West End?" Robertson responded, "Yes, I would be open an apology." Six years later, on July 10, 2014, CBC radio host, Rick Cluff, read a statement on air from the City in response to news of our proposal to seek an official apology and reparations: "The City takes the issue of safety and well-being of sex workers seriously. We look forward to working with the West End Sex Work Memorial Committee on reviewing any proposal they put forward." In view of (now) Mayor Robertson's clearly articulated openness, and the City's offer to work with us, we trust that you will give our proposal your most serious consideration.

¹ The archival and interview-based data collection and analysis upon which this submission is based, were conducted by Becki Ross, Department of Sociology and Institute for Gender, Race, Sexuality, and Social Justice, University of British Columbia. Ross's research was funded by the *Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada* (SSHRC, 2007-2011). At various points, Jamie Lee Hamilton has held the position of research associate and collaborator. To date, three articles from our study have been published in internationally renowned, peer-reviewed journals. Ross and Hamilton have presented findings at conferences in Vancouver and Victoria, as well as at the Museum of Vancouver, Fox Cabaret, Vancouver Police Museum, Simon Fraser University, McMaster University, UBC-Vancouver, UBC-Okanagan, University of Toronto, Thompson Rivers University, Mount Royal University, and UC Santa Barbara. Our study has attracted media coverage - *CBC radio* ('Early Edition' & 'On the Coast'), *Vancouver Sun*, *Straight.com*, and *Xtra!*



Historical Context

As you may recall, on July 4, 1984, the Chief Justice of the British Columbia Supreme Court, Allan McEachern, ruled that sex workers on the Davie Street stroll were a “blatant, aggressive, and disorderly public nuisance.” He chastised those who “defiled our city” by “taking over the streets and sidewalks for the purpose of prostitution.”² To remedy what he called the “urban tragedy” of the West End, Justice McEachern banned female, male, and transsexual prostitutes from their own neighborhood. His unprecedented ruling was championed by then mayor Mike Harcourt, Attorney General Brian Smith, and Member of Parliament for Vancouver Centre, Pat Carney. Concerned Residents of the West End (CROWE) and their vigilante posse, Shame the Johns, were elated about the purge of a ‘de facto red light district’ from their largely white, seaside, middle-class enclave. Civic officials and moral entrepreneurs of all political stripes keen to cleanse and whiten the city in advance of Expo ‘86, celebrated an end to their ‘war on hookers.’

Importantly, past relations between sex workers and other Vancouver residents were not always adversarial. In the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, the sex trade in both Vancouver and Victoria represented an essential engine of economic growth, with legendary brothels operating openly (with upwards of 40 in Vancouver until the 1920s).³ As Trina Ricketts et al. conclude in their study, *History of Sex Work: Vancouver*, “Sex workers have always been, and remain to this day an integral part of our city and have contributed greatly to its colour, diversity, and personality.”⁴ In Vancouver, relations soured and became overtly acrimonious after the Penthouse Cabaret and other off-street locales were raided by police and closed in the mid-1970s. As the West End stroll swelled in size, anti-prostitution organizing gathered steam. By the mid-1980s, evidence of the robust community built by ‘hookers on Davie’ had all but disappeared.⁵

Anti-Prostitution Initiatives by mayor Mike Harcourt and city councilors

Prior to Justice McEachern’s injunction, mayor Harcourt and city councilors approved three initiatives designed to intensify regulation of on-street sex work, with the ultimate aim of prohibiting street-based sexual commerce.

1) **First**, in August 1981, city councilors voted to thwart sexual commerce between sex workers and customers in the West End through physical impediments: the Engineering Department was given a budget to implement cement traffic diverters, traffic islands, signage for new turn controls, roundabouts, laneway lighting, and a cul-de-sac.

² Alan McEachern, “*Attorney General of British Columbia v. Couillard et al.*,” 110.

³ See Trina Ricketts et al, *History of Sex Work: Vancouver*, Deborah Nilson, “The Social Evil,” Patrick Dunae, “Geographies of Sexual Commerce,” and Daniel Francis, *Red Light Neon*.

⁴ Ibid., Ricketts et al, *History of Sex Work: Vancouver*, i.

⁵ See the poignant documentary film, “Hookers on Davie,” directed by Holly Dale and Janis Cole.



Sex workers living and working in the West End were not consulted about these impediments. Sadly, today, these are the only signs that attest to a once-vibrant community of adult sex workers.⁶

2) **Second**, in April 1982, a ‘street activities’ bylaw was passed by City Council to curb what mayor Harcourt called a “hooker takeover” in the West End.⁷ Fines from \$350 to \$2,000 were imposed on sex workers charged by police with street solicitation. Dubbed the “anti-hooker” bylaw in the mainstream press, it was widely applauded as an ingenious, municipal solution to controlling a crime defined under the federal *Criminal Code*. At demonstrations on Broadway Street protesting the new bylaw, sex workers carried placards that read, ‘Harcourt is Our Pimp.’ In 1983, the Canadian Supreme Court ruled in *Westendorp vs. Regina* that a similar municipal bylaw enacted in Calgary was ultra vires of federal jurisdiction.⁸ As such, the bylaw in both cities was shelved, but not before 500 charges were laid in Vancouver, and \$28,000 in fines were illegally extracted from sex workers during an 18-month period.⁹

3) **Third**, in 1983, mayor Harcourt approved the hiring of Gordon Price as the West End Community Coordinator on a 6-month contract, paid for by the city’s Social Planning Department. Price, then leader of Concerned Residents of the West End (CROWE), pocketed \$15,000 to research “the conflict in the West End.” Indeed, Price was paid to advance CROWE’s mandate to abolish prostitution from the West End. We argue that Price’s appointment exposed Harcourt’s own anti-prostitution agenda, and placed Price in a grave conflict of interest. Price and CROWE were undeniably influential in setting the terms of debate; for instance, CROWE disingenuously recast the West End as a ‘residential’ space in spite the bustling commercial activity, including 24-hour a day businesses, on Davie and Denman streets. CROWE’s singular goal was to relocate ‘noisy hookers’ back to their ‘rightful place’ (back) on the city’s racialized, working-class east side in and around Chinatown.

Revenue from Vancouver’s taxpayers funded all three initiatives - the West End Traffic Plan, the street activities bylaw, and the hiring of Gordon Price. We argue that in the eyes of city officials, protection of public propriety and property values trumped the right of West End sex workers to life, liberty, and security of the person in their own occupational and residential enclave.

⁶ Details of the “Traffic Plan” reported in the City Manager’s Reports, October 30, 1981. City of Vancouver Archives, City Council Minutes, Microform, Series 31, Sept. –Nov. 1981.

⁷ Mike Harcourt, cited in Anonymous, “Fast Action Urged on Hooker Problem,” A10.

⁸ Supreme Court of Canada, *Westendorp vs. The Queen*, 1983.

⁹ See Becki Ross, “Sex and (Evacuation from) the City: The Moral and Legal Regulation of Sex Workers in Vancouver’s West End, 1975-1985,” 197-218.



Lethal Consequences of Justice McEachern's Injunction

In July 1984, the BC Supreme Court ruling was a crushing blow to the approximately 200 sex workers in the West End. Since the early 1970s, predominantly Aboriginal, Filipina, and African Canadian sex workers had built stable friendships, a clientele, community connections, and economic capacity as independent, pimp-free contractors. Their earnings enhanced the bottom line of the West End's four national banks and the myriad businesses they patronized. To improve working conditions, they developed strategies for risk assessment, safety planning, and harm reduction.¹⁰ Co-workers often shared apartments, worked in pairs, recorded license-plate numbers of clients, and protected each other through the bonds of their outdoor brothel culture. Details of 'bad dates' and violent police were communicated by Vancouver's first sex workers' rights organization, the Alliance for the Safety of Prostitutes (ASP), in their newsletter, *The Whoreganizer*.¹¹ In 1984, in their brief to the federal government's Fraser Committee on Pornography and Prostitution, ASP members argued that sex workers should be permitted to operate in their own homes singly or in pairs, or in licensed, non-residential brothels.

After McEachern's callous injunction in 1984, on-street sex workers were forced to relocate east of Granville Street, first to working-class Mount Pleasant, and then to what became the killing fields of the city's Downtown Eastside, with 65 women murdered since the mid-1980s.¹² Raigen, a survivor of the West End mass eviction, made this observation in an interview with us in 2008:

CROWE and the Judge said that it was okay to violate prostitutes... And what happened right after that? More missing women, people dying, people getting stabbed like crazy...I was stabbed 17 times for giving a guy head, after being evicted from the West End when I was working Broadway Street in Mount Pleasant. This was the sad thing, because in the West End we'd take license plate numbers for each other, we told each other about bad dates. After the eviction, I had guns to my head. I was incarcerated with men. I was raped in jail and forced to give head to many people in jail....Today, we need to have a float in the Pride Parade with a whole bunch of coffins on the trailer.¹³

¹⁰ See Becki Ross, "'Outdoor Brothel Culture: The Un/Making of a Transsexual Stroll in Vancouver's West End, 1975-1984," 126-150.

¹¹ Also see Marie Arrington, "Community Organizing," 104-108.

¹² See John Lowman, "Violence and the Outlaw Status of (Street) Prostitution," 987-2011.

¹³ Raigen, cited in Ross, *Outdoor Brothel Culture*, 142.



Speaking on behalf of purged sex workers, Jamie Lee Hamilton concluded,

We were no force against the ballooning, white middle-class and their friends in high places, in political power... It was a social massacre. The injunction disenfranchised us, and split us from one another. It was like residential schools for First Nations was a social massacre: "Kill the Indian in the child." This was "Kill the sex worker in the West End."¹⁴

Back then, outdoor sex workers possessed little political, economic, or social capital to mount a legal counter-challenge. They lacked support and resources from logical allies such as gay liberationists, second-wave feminists, labour leaders, and progressive lawyers who dithered in the face of what many believed was a contentious issue.¹⁵

Moving Forward: Apology, Redress, and Memorial

To right this historical wrong we seek a formal, public apology from Mayor Gregor Robertson. And because former mayor Harcourt collected \$28,000 in illegal fines from sex workers, we seek financial reparations. Our plan is to use the refunded monies for a permanent Memorial near the corner of Bute and Davie streets. We envision a plaque affixed to a wrought-iron lamppost with a bronze, stiletto-heeled shoe at its base.¹⁶ Our aim is to remember and honor the sex workers who were subjected to an act of dehumanizing domestic terrorism in the West End thirty years ago. The expulsion was unjust and discriminatory. Sex workers on the West End stroll were mothers, sisters, brothers, daughters, sons, aunts, uncles & workers; they deserved better than to have been shunted 'out of sight' and 'out of mind'. Years later, sex worker and activist Susan Davis reflected on the carnage catalyzed by the West End expulsion: "I invite everyone to take some time and remember the casualties of Canada's quiet war. They had families and dreams. The loss to the community of their potential and light is immeasurable. They may be gone, but they must never be forgotten."¹⁷

Our Memorial would be a symbol of respect. It would serve to raise awareness of social injustice in the spirit of other memorials in Vancouver – the *Komagata Maru* memorial in Coal Harbour, the *AIDS memorial* at English Bay, the *Marker of Change* in Thornton Park to remember the women murdered at École Polytechnique in Montréal, and *The Heart Has Its Own Memory* in the Downtown Eastside, to honor murdered and

¹⁴ Jamie Lee, cited in Ross and Sullivan, "Tracing Lines of Horizontal Hostility," 614.

¹⁵ Ibid., see Ross and Sullivan, "Tracing the Lines of Horizontal Hostility," 604-621.

¹⁶ For the memorial, we would advertise a competition, targeting recent graduates from urban design programs at Emily Carr University, SFU, UBC, and BCIT.

¹⁷ Susan Davis, cited in Trina Ricketts, et al., *History of Sex Work: Vancouver*, 35.



missing Aboriginal women. Our memorial would be beautiful and statuesque; it would draw residents and visitors to its uplifting message of community building, fortitude, and resilience.

We believe that this moment is ripe for redress. In December 2013, Justices at the Supreme Court of Canada bravely declared prostitution-related laws unconstitutional. “Sex for money is not a crime,” wrote Chief Justice Beverley McLachlin.¹⁸ In June 2014, however, the federal Justice Minister Peter MacKay introduced Bill C-36 as the foundation for new prostitution laws, which seek to criminalize clients (mostly men) who purchase sexual services, and make it illegal for any sex worker to do business “within the vicinity of children.” On the cusp of MacKay’s punitive new law, sex workers and allies warn of atrocities looming on the horizon. Drawing from more than thirty-five years of researching the sex industry and law enforcement in Vancouver, Dr. John Lowman, criminologist at Simon Fraser University, recently concluded that the demand-side prohibition in Bill C-36 will only increase the risks associated with prostitution, not reduce them.¹⁹ Lowman added that the “de facto criminal prohibition of prostitution” and the “moral-political stigmatization of prostitutes” constitute “the main obstacles to creating safer working conditions for prostitutes.”²⁰

Since prostitution was decriminalized in New Zealand in 2003, sex workers have successfully established worker-run cooperatives, paid taxes, insisted on freedom from police intimidation, and pursued legal recourse in the event of sexual harassment.²¹ Evidence-based research and the New Zealand government’s own evaluation have documented marked improvements in sex workers’ health and safety.²² Sex work professionals in Vancouver, including survivors of the West End’s mass eviction, have enacted similar strategies of self-governance as adults who choose to work in the industry.²³ According to Tamara O’Doherty’s recent, Vancouver-based study (2011), women who practiced prostitution indoors in massage parlours, escort services, and independently, experienced considerably lower rates of violence than (the mostly poor, Aboriginal) street-based survival sex workers in the Downtown Eastside.²⁴

¹⁸ See Supreme Court of Canada, McLachlin et al., *Canada (Attorney General) vs. Bedford*, December 2013.

¹⁹ John Lowman, “Tripping Point” (2014). Lowman also maintains that there have been 200 to 300 sex work homicide victims in Canada since the federal law against communication in a public place took effect in December 1985.

²⁰ John Lowman, “Violence and the Outlaw Status of (Street) Prostitution,” 1006-1007.

²¹ See G. Abel et al, *Taking the Crime out of Sex Work: New Zealand sex workers’ fight for decriminalization*, 2010.

²² See Abel et al, *The Impact of Prostitution Reform Act*, 2008.

²³ See BC Coalition of Experiential Communities, *Trade Secrets for Sex Industry Workers*.

²⁴ See Tamara O’Doherty, “Victimization in Off-Street Sex Industry Work,” 1-20.



Sex Work-Related Social Justice Initiatives by Vancouver's Mayor and City Council

We understand that Mayor Robertson and City Council have been pro-active in working toward ensuring the safety and well being of sex workers in Vancouver. The Mayor's office has recently appointed two sex industry community liaison officers, following from recommendations by Wally Oppal in his report on murdered and missing women, *Forsaken* (2012). In his "Executive Summary," Oppal concludes:

I have found that the missing and murdered women were forsaken twice: once by society at larger and again by the police. There is no mirroring concept of 'unforsaken', but together we can work toward this end by protecting and supporting vulnerable women. Together, we can and we must, build a legacy of safety to honour the missing and murdered women who are remembered and missed....It is only together that we can ensure that, while the women are gone, they are not forgotten."²⁵

On the theme of safety, we commend the City of Vancouver's "Mayor's Achievement Award" recently bestowed upon Katrina Pacey of Pivot Legal Society for her work in fighting the decriminalization of prostitution at the Supreme Court of Canada. And we applaud the Mayor and City Council's declaration, in late June, that Vancouver is on unceded, occupied, and traditional lands of the Musqueam, Squamish, and Tsleil-Waututh First Nations.

In this spirit of recognition, and as another step on the road toward remembrance, reconciliation, and healing, we maintain that a Memorial in the West End is essential to advancing sex workers' inclusion, safety, and belonging: in a word, their full and substantive citizenship. We have the collective opportunity interrupt and overturn what John Lowman has termed the "discourse of disposal" concerning street prostitution in Vancouver, and across Canada."²⁶ Concretely, our Memorial will symbolize and materialize the four themes identified by Commissioner Oppal as pivotal to overturning the legacy of "blatant failures": equality, community engagement, collaboration, and accountability.²⁷

While many of Oppal's recommendations target the Provincial Government, we maintain that the City of Vancouver is best positioned to assume a leadership role in partnership with our West End Sex Work Memorial Project. Our proposal is modest in scope: it will not solve centuries of colonization, the feminization of poverty, the ravages of addiction, or some men's sexualized violence against women, hustlers, and trans people. However, it is our contention that your official apology, twinned with our

²⁵ Wally Oppal, *Forsaken: The Report of the Missing Women Commission of Inquiry, Executive Summary*, 160.

²⁶ John Lowman, "Violence and the Outlaw Status of (Street) Prostitution," 987.

²⁷ *Ibid.*, Oppal, *Forsaken*, 160.



Memorial, will further sex workers' health, safety, and human rights in Vancouver. Moreover, both initiatives will solidly advance your Living in Community Action Plan, and complement progressive policy implementation concerning the sex industry already underway.

We are gathering the names of community groups in Vancouver, and in the West End, who keenly support our proposal, including sex worker-led organizations such as PACE, PEERS, Hustle, Boys R Us, BC Coalition of Experiential Communities, West Coast Cooperative of Sex Industry Professionals, and Sex Workers United Against Violence (SWUAV). We are available to work with you at your earliest convenience. We look forward to next steps. Thank you, most genuinely, for your time and attention.

Yours sincerely,

A handwritten signature in grey ink that reads "Audu Pan".

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to be "Becki Ross" and "Jamie Lee Hamilton" written together in a stylized, overlapping manner.

Becki Ross and Jamie Lee Hamilton

Becki Ross
becki.ross@ubc.ca

Jamie Lee Hamilton
Tricia_foxx@yahoo.com



Works Cited

Abel, G., L. Fitzgerald, C. Healy, and A. Reed. *Taking the Crime out of Sex Work: New Zealand sex workers' fight for decriminalization*. Bristol, UK: Polity Press, 2010.

Abel, G., L. Fitzgerald, and C. Brunton, *The Impact of the Prostitution Reform Act on the Health and Safety Practices of Sex Workers*. Christchurch, NZ: Prostitution Law Review Committee, 2008.

Alliance for the Safety of Prostitutes, "Prostitution," a brief presented to the "Fraser Commission," January 1984, 20. University of British Columbia, Rare Books and Special Collections, Service and Office Retail Workers Union of Canada, Legal 1984, Box 1, File 13.

Amnesty International, "Stolen Sisters: A Human Rights Response to Discrimination and Violence Against Indigenous Women in Canada," 2004.
<http://www.amnesty.ca/campaigns/resources/amr200304.pdf>.

Anonymous, "Fast Action Urged on Hooker Problem," *Vancouver Sun* (May 14, 1982), A10.

Arrington, Marie, "Community Organizing," in *Good Girls/Bad Girls: Sex Trade Workers and Feminists Face to Face*, 104-108. ed. Laurie Bell (Toronto: Women's Press, 1987): 104-108.

Benoit, Cecilia, and A. Miller, *Dispelling Myths and Understanding Realities: Working Conditions, Health Status, and Exiting Experiences of Sex Workers*. Victoria, BC: Prostitutes, Education, Empowerment, and Resource Society (PEERS), 2011.

BC Coalition of Experiential Communities, *Trade Secrets for Sex Industry Workers*, Vancouver, BC.

Brock, Deborah. *Making Work, Making Trouble: The Social Regulation of Sexual Labour*. 2nd ed. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2009.

Dale, Holly, and Janis Cole, dirs., "Hookers on Davie." Spectrum Films, Toronto: Ont, 1984.

Dunae, Patrick, "Geographies of sexual commerce and the production of prostitutional space: Victoria, British Columbia, 1860-1914," *Journal of the Canadian Historical Association*, 19:1 (2008): 115-142.



Francis, Daniel, *Red Light Neon: A History of Vancouver's Sex Trade*, Vancouver, BC: Subway Books, 2006.

Fraser Committee, Pornography and Prostitution in Canada. Report of the Special Committee on Pornography and Prostitution. Ottawa: Department of Supply and Services, 1985, 530-553.

Hallgrimsdottir, Helga K., Rachel Phillips and Cecilia Benoit, "Fallen Women and Rescued Girls: Social Stigma and Media Narratives of the Sex Industry in Victoria, B.C., from 1980 to 2005," *Canadian Review of Sociology and Anthropology* (August 2006): 265-280.

Jeffrey, Leslie Ann, and Gayle MacDonald, *Sex Workers in the Maritimes Talk Back* Vancouver: UBC Press, 2006.

Jiwani, Jasmin, and Mary Lynn Young, "Missing and Murdered Women: Reproducing Marginality in News Discourse," *Canadian Journal of Communication* 31:4 (2006): 895-917.

Lowman, John, with assistance of Laura Fraser, *Street Prostitution: Assessing the Impact of the Law: Vancouver* (Ottawa: Department of Justice Canada, 1989),

Lowman, John, "Street Prostitution in Vancouver: Some Notes on the Genesis of a Social Problem," *Canadian Journal of Criminology* 28 (1986): 1-16.

_____. "Violence and the Outlaw Status of (Street) Prostitution in Canada," *Violence Against Women* 6(9) (2000): 987-1011.

_____. Crown Expert-Witness Testimony in *Bedford v. Canada*: Evidence-based Argument or Victim-Paradigm Hyperbole?" In E. Van der Meulen, E. Durisin and V. Love, eds. *Selling Sex: Canadian Academics, Advocates, and Sex Workers in Dialogue*, pp. 230-250. Vancouver: UBC Press, 2013.

_____. "Tripping Point: Brief to the Standing Committee on Justice and Human Rights on The Protection of Communities and Exploited Persons Act," Vancouver, BC, 2014.

McEachern, Allan, "Attorney General of British Columbia v. Couillard et al." Judgment July 4, 1984, in *British Columbia Law Reports* Vol. 59, Part I, (Calgary, Alta: Carswell Legal Publications, 1985).



Moores, Patrick, "(Re)Covering the Missing Women: News Media Reporting on Vancouver's Disappeared," unpublished M.A. thesis, Department of Sociology, University of British Columbia, 2006.

Nilson, Deborah, "'The Social Evil': Prostitution in Vancouver 1900-1920," in *In Her Own Right*, eds. Barbara Latham and Cathy Kess (Victoria BC: Camosun College, 1980): 205-28.

O'Doherty, Tamara, "Victimization in Off-Street Sex Industry Work," *Violence Against Women*, 20:10 (2011): 1-20.

Oppal, Wally, *Forsaken: The Report of the Missing Women Commission of Inquiry, Executive Summary*, British Columbia, 2012.

www.bcsolutions.gov.bc.ca/opc/

Pivot Legal Society, [*Voices for Dignity: A Call to End the Harms Caused by Canada's Sex Trade Laws*](#), 2004.

Pivot Legal Society, [*Beyond Decriminalization: Sex Work, Human Rights and a New Framework for Law Reform*](#), 2006.

Rickets, Trina, Susan Davis, Stacey Grayer, Candice Hansen, Jennifer Allan, Chanel Martin, *History of Sex Work: Vancouver; Who we were, who we are*. Community Education Program, Simon Fraser University.

Ross, Becki, "Sex and (Evacuation from) the City: The Moral and Legal Regulation of Sex Workers in Vancouver's West End, 1975-1985," *Sexualities* 13:2 (April, 2010): 197-218.

<http://sexualities.sagepub.com.ezproxy.library.ubc.ca/content/13/2/197.full.pdf+html>

_____. "Outdoor Brothel Culture: The Un/Making of a Transsexual Stroll in Vancouver's West End, 1975-1984," *Journal of Historical Sociology* (March 2012): 126-150.

<http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com.ezproxy.library.ubc.ca/doi/10.1111/j.1467-6443.2011.01411.x/pdf>

Ross, Becki and Rachael Sullivan, "Tracing Lines of Horizontal Hostility: How Sex Workers and Gay Liberation Activists Battled for Space, Voice, and Belonging in Vancouver, 1975-1985," Special Double Issue on Sex Work, *Sexualities* 15:5/6 (September 2012): 604-621.

Supreme Court of Canada, *Westendorp vs. The Queen*, [1983] 1 SCR 43.

<http://scc-csc.lexum.com/scc-csc/scc-csc/en/item/1/index.do>



Supreme Court of Canada, McLachlin et al., *Canada (Attorney General) vs. Bedford*, 2013 SCC 72, [2013] 3 S.C.R. 1101. <http://scc-csc.lexum.com/scc-csc/scc-csc/en/item/13389/index.do>

ni? ct xaʔəmətəl, tə ʔnimət, tə təməxʷ ʔi? tə kʷaʔkʷə 1 *

We watch over the land and sea and in turn they watch over us.

September 4, 2014

Becki Ross
becki.ross@ubc.ca

Jamie Lee Hamilton
Tricia_foxx@yahoo.com

Dear Ms. Hamilton and Ms. Ross,

RE: Redress for Sex Workers Expelled from Vancouver's West End

Thank you for your proposal received June 16, 2014, on the West End Sex Work Memorial Project and its rationale, historical context and proposed next steps that the City can take towards reconciliation. We acknowledge your request of a formal apology and reparations in the amount of \$28,000 for fines collected in relation to sex work in the Vancouver's West End community in the early 1980's and commend your on-going commitment and advocacy on these important issues.

The City continues to strive to reduce social and legal inequities related to sex work and to address issues of sexual exploitation. As you are aware, City Council unanimously supported a number of initiatives to help address the health and safety of sex workers, neighbourhoods impacted by sex work and the prevention of the sexual exploitation of youth. The December 18th Council report, *Report Back on Missing Women Commission of Inquiry and City Task Force on Sex Work and Sexual Exploitation*, resulted in a total of \$100,600 in new grant funding as well as amendments to the License and Club Regulation By-laws that introduced new requirements to address safety and community concerns to support the Missing Women Commission of Inquiry recommendations and City Task Force priorities.

In 2014 the City hired two staff to liaise with the community and Vancouver Police Department on sex work and sexual exploitation issues and contributed, along with both federal and provincial governments, toward compensation of \$50,000 per child to the children of the missing and murdered women, many of whom were survival sex workers, to enhance their education, housing or other circumstances. Recently, City staff responded to the Department of Justice on potential changes to Canada's prostitution laws as a result of the Bedford decision and the Standing Committee on Justice and Human Rights regarding the potential implications of the new proposed legislation.



ni? ct xaʔəmətəl, tə ʔnimət, tə təməxʷ ʔi? tə kʷaʔkʷə 1 *

We watch over the land and sea and in turn they watch over us.

It is important that Council as a whole provide a collective response to your submission. Currently, Council is recessing for the summer break, but will reconvene in the fall, at which time we will be better prepared to respond. In the interim staff are establishing a process to review your submission to assist Council and ensure that it is given every consideration. Staff may, under the guidance of our City Manager, Dr. Penny Ballem, ask for further information from you to assist in this process.

Thank you for your on-going commitment, leadership and advocacy on these important issues. If you have any immediate questions, please don't hesitate to contact Dr. Penny Ballem at 604 873 7625 or electronically at penny.ballem@vancouver.ca or Mary Clare Zak, Managing Director, Social Policy at 604 871 6643 or maryclare.zak@vancouver.ca

Sincerely,



Gregor Robertson
MAYOR



MEMORANDUM

August 29, 2016

TO: Mayor and Council

CC: Sadhu Johnston, City Manager
Paul Mochrie, Deputy City Manager
Janice MacKenzie, City Clerk
Lynda Graves, Manager, Administration Services, City Manager's Office
Mukhtar Latif, Chief Housing Officer, City Manager's Office
Mike Magee, Special Advisor to the Mayor
Kevin Quinlan, Chief of Staff, Mayor's Office
Katie Robb, Director of Communications, Mayor's Office
Rena Kendall-Craden, Director, Communications
Kaye Krishna, General Manager, Development Services, Building and Licensing
Gil Kelley, General Manager, Planning, Urban Design and Sustainability
Andrew Naklicki, Chief Human Resources Officer, Human Resources
Malcolm Bromley, General Manager, Parks and Recreation
Patrice Impey, General Manager, Finance, Risk and Business Planning
Bill Aujla, General Manager, Real Estate and Facilities Management
John McKearney, Fire Chief and General Manager, Fire and Rescue Services
Francie Connell, Director, Legal Services
Jerry Dobrovolny, General Manager, Engineering Services
Sandra Singh, Chief Librarian, Vancouver Public Library
Adam Palmer, Chief Constable, Vancouver Police Department
MaryClare Zak, Managing Director Social Policy and Projects

FROM: Kathleen Llewellyn-Thomas, General Manager, Community Services

SUBJECT: West End Sex Workers Memorial Event

This memo informs Mayor and Council on the details and background of the West End Sex Workers Memorial and an upcoming event on September 16th.

The event includes a public unveiling of a commemorative memorial at 1103 Jervis Street, adjacent to St. James Anglican Church, in recognition of a community of sex workers with diverse cultural and gender identities who were displaced from Vancouver's West End in 1984

and to acknowledge the harms created by City policy and practice at that time. Between the mid-1970s and mid-1980s the West End neighbourhood was experiencing considerable demographic shifts and community opposition to street-based sex work became a matter of vocal public concern. Former City officials responded with traffic calming measures, by-law regulation and other efforts to discourage sex work in the neighbourhood.

The City is contributing \$28,000 to cover costs of the memorial and installation. In doing so it acknowledges that while City actions were intended to secure community safety, they created additional conditions of vulnerability, stigma and harm to sex workers. While the City is now known for evidence-informed approaches to sex work related issues, this memorial will reconcile past actions with present practices that align with Council priorities to create safe and inclusive communities for all residents (Appendix B highlights recent City efforts).

The West End Sex Workers Memorial will be the first of its kind in Canada. There are examples of memorials in cities worldwide: Amsterdam and Sydney have erected sculptures; London has a historic graveyard marker; and three cities in California have affixed commemorative plaques to heritage venues and sites.

Staff have worked with the co-founders of the West End Sex Workers Memorial Committee, Dr. Becki Ross and Jamie Lee Hamilton, on all stages of the project process: community engagement, fabrication of the memorial, and the upcoming September 16th event.

Background:

In 1981, a resident group formed to mobilize community members and local government to curb the sex trade in the West End. The group gained momentum through the support of local officials who advocated for all three levels of government for stricter regulation.

Between 1981 and 1983, City actions included: installing traffic diverters to impede traffic associated with sex work; enacting a street activities bylaw in 1982 which imposed fines from \$350 - \$2,000 on sex workers and consumers; and hiring a West End coordinator to abolish sex work from the neighbourhood.

These actions, coupled with rising community protests against street-based sex work, culminated in the 1984 BC Supreme Court decision to pass an injunction that then influenced succeeding federal legislation that further criminalized those in sex work, an approach the City would no longer support.

In July 2014, Mayor and Council received a proposal from the West End Sex Workers Memorial Committee requesting reparations in the form of a public civic apology and the installation of a memorial for the harms created by municipal efforts.

In June 2015, staff recommended an acknowledgement of the historical harms by recompensing for the reported \$28,000 of fines collected with the provision of the memorial to the former City Manager.

Next Steps: Appendix B provides details on the memorial and the event that is being organized by the West End Sex Workers Memorial Committee. All elected officials are invited and Councillors Reimer, Ball and Carr will speak at the event.

If you have any questions please contact me or Mary Clare Zak at Maryclare.zak@vancouver.ca
or 604.871.6643

Kathleen Llewellyn-Thomas, P.Eng.
General Manager

tel: 604.871.6858

fax: 604.871.6497

kathleen.llewellyn-thomas@vancouver.ca

KL/

RELATED CITY INITIATIVES

The long-standing challenge to regulate sex work in Canada by governments, courts, policy-makers, legal experts, researchers, sex workers and others continues today. However, an ample and growing body of global research and best practice provides greater evidence and understanding of the need to incorporate inclusive, equitable and sustainable strategies that strengthen local capacity to respond to the impacts of sex work on individuals and communities.

This evidence informs the City's current approach to addressing issues related to sex work as is demonstrated by the following:

1. Healthy City Strategy: The project directly aligns with the HCS *Goal #6: Being Safe and Feeling Included*. This goal acknowledges that safety and inclusion are realized within a context of societal inequities, requiring concrete actions to achieve systemic change. As well, the 2015-2018 HCS Action Plan includes an action to “examine regulations, policies and processes that affect our relationships with and between residents - past, present and future.”
2. The City's response to the Missing Women Commission of Inquiry: specifically, its central message that the systemic bias towards sex workers led to the tragedy of the missing and murdered women in Vancouver's Downtown Eastside.¹
3. The commitment of the City to take a leadership and coordination role to decrease the marginalization of sex workers, as noted in the 2011 Council report, *Preventing Sexual Exploitation and Protecting Vulnerable Adults and Neighbourhoods Affected by Sex Work: A Comprehensive Approach and Action Plan*.²
4. The recommendations of City Task Force on Sex Work and Sexual Exploitation in the subsequent 2013 Council report, *Report to Council on Missing Women Commission of Inquiry and City Task Force on Sex Work and Sexual Exploitation*.³
5. The Vancouver Police Department's Sex Work Enforcement Guidelines adopted in 2013, which outline an equitable, graduated approach to enforcement for the safety of all individuals and communities.⁴
6. The City of Vancouver Sex Work Response Guidelines released in September 2015, which promote a non-discriminatory and consistent approach for all City staff when addressing issues related to sex work.⁵
7. The City's and Vancouver Coastal Health's 2015 joint brief, submitted to the Senate and House of Commons, which advocates for evidence-based and human rights approaches to inform national and local legislation.⁶

¹ <http://vancouver.ca/people-programs/Health-and-safety-for-sex-workers.aspx>

² <http://former.vancouver.ca/ctyclerk/cclerk/20110922/documents/penv4.pdf>

³ <http://former.vancouver.ca/ctyclerk/cclerk/20131218/documents/cfsc7.pdf>

⁴ <http://vancouver.ca/police/assets/pdf/reports-policies/sex-enforcement-guidelines.pdf>

⁵ <http://vancouver.ca/files/cov/sex-work-response-guidelines.pdf>

⁶ <http://vancouver.ca/files/cov/City-of-vancouver-brief-bill-C-36-protection-communities-exploited-persons-act.pdf>

WEST END SEX WORKERS MEMORIAL & EVENT DETAILS

Design

The memorial is a traditional black lamp post that bears a simple bronzed inscription “WEST END SEX WORKERS MEMORIAL” on all four sides of the central base.

On the bottom four sides of the base, the below phrases appear under the main inscription:

1. DEDICATED TO A DIVERSE COMMUNITY OF SEX WORKERS
2. PEOPLE WHO LIVED AND WORKED HERE FROM MID 1960s - 1984
3. IN MEMORY OF THEIR ONGOING STRUGGLE FOR EQUALITY
4. TODAY, WE COMMEMORATE AND HONOUR THEIR LIVES

Location

The chosen site is adjacent to St. Paul’s Anglican Church at 1130 Jervis Street, which served as a former place of refuge and support for sex workers in the West End. The Church has fully endorsed the memorial’s installation.

Community Consultation

In November 2015, the City supported a community forum, led by the committee, to inform the public on the history, purpose and spirit of the memorial project. Staff extended notification in January 2016 with an information letter to residents, businesses and community associations within a two-block radius of the memorial site. The City did not receive any responses to the letter.

Event

150 people have been invited to the event that will take place at St Paul’s Anglican Church, and hosted by the West End Sex Workers Memorial Committee. If City officials are interested in participating, please contact Dr. Becki Ross at Becki.Ross@ubc.ca.

The details are as follows:

Event	<i>West End Sex Workers Memorial Event</i>
Organizers	West End Sex Workers Memorial Committee with support from the City
Location	St. Paul’s Anglican Church, 1130 Jervis Street
Date	Friday, September 16, 2016
Time	11AM - 1:30PM (Lunch and Refreshments will be served)
Speakers	<p><i>Elected Officials:</i> Dr. Hedy Fry, Jenny Kwan, Spencer Chandra Herbert, Melanie Mark, Philip Owen, Libby Davis, Councillor Andrea Reimer, Councillor Adrian Carr, Councillor Elizabeth Ball,</p> <p><i>City/VPD Staff:</i> Mary Clare Zak, Managing Director of Social Policy and Projects, Michelle Davey, Superintendent</p> <p><i>Community groups:</i> Jamie Lee Hamilton, Dr. Becki Ross, Dr. CJ Rowe, Executive Director QMunity, Tracy Porteous, Executive Director Ending Violence Association of BC, Fraser Doke, Paige Latin.</p>

MEMORANDUM

September 30, 2015

TO: Mayor and Council

FROM: City Manager

SUBJECT: West End Sex Work Memorial Project

This memo informs Mayor and Council of two memorials that are either underway or under consideration to acknowledge historical harms the City incurred with respect to sex workers in Vancouver. The memorials are being undertaken in the spirit of promoting the human rights of all residents and of reconciliation within our communities. While the City is known across the country and internationally for our efforts to develop evidence-based and equitable approaches when addressing issues related to sex work and for our response to the Missing Women Commission of Inquiry, including the hiring of two staff mandated to increase the health and safety of sex workers and mitigate the impacts of sex work on communities, a formal acknowledgement would help facilitate healing and mark our continued efforts to continually improve our responses and the conditions of vulnerability that sex workers experience.

Background

In July 2014, Mayor and Council received a proposal from the West End Sex Work Memorial Committee (WESWMC) requesting reparation, including a formal acknowledgement of the harms created by the City's efforts, and those of other groups, to displace sex workers from the West End during the 1980's. (see letter attached). Actions by the City included approval of a street activities bylaw in 1982 to curb street based sex work and which imposed fines from \$350- \$2,000 (the bylaw has since been repealed), and the hiring of a West End coordinator with a publicly stated agenda to abolish prostitution from the West End. These measures displaced individuals to other more isolated and unsafe areas, including the DTES, creating additional vulnerability risks. The WESWMC requested that the City make a formal apology and install a Memorial near Jervis and Pendrell Streets.

There is a growing number of cities across the world that, in recent years, have established memorials to sex workers, including Amsterdam, Sydney (AU), London (UK) and Ukiah (USA). Vancouver will be the first city in Canada to take such action.

Memo to Council WESWMP

Another memorial, to be located in the DTES, is being considered to acknowledge/commemorate historical wrongs related to the missing and murdered women. The community consultation process for this memorial is just getting underway, and will be the subject of a future memo to Mayor and Council.

Both memorials will serve as a reminder of past harmful societal attitudes towards sex workers, encourage reconciliation in the present, and preserve social memory to help shape equitable and inclusive communities in the future.

Related City initiatives:

The project is consistent with:

1. **Healthy City Strategy:** In particular, the project directly aligns with the HCS *Goal #6: Being Safe and Feeling Included*. This goal acknowledges that safety and inclusion are realized within a context of societal inequities, requiring concrete actions to achieve systemic change.
2. The City's response to the **Missing Women Commission of Inquiry** – specifically, its central message that the systemic bias towards sex workers led to the tragedy of the missing and murdered women in Vancouver's Downtown Eastside.¹
3. The commitment of the City to take a leadership and coordination role to increase the social inclusion of sex workers, as noted in the 2011 Council report, *Preventing Sexual Exploitation and Protecting Vulnerable Adults and Neighbourhoods Affected by Sex Work: A Comprehensive Approach and Action Plan*.²
4. The recommendations of **City Task Force on Sex Work and Sexual Exploitation** in the subsequent 2013 Council report, *Report to Council on Missing Women Commission of Inquiry and City Task Force on Sex Work and Sexual Exploitation*.³
5. The **City of Vancouver Sex Work Response Guidelines**, released in September 2015, that promote a non-discriminatory, respectful and consistent approach for all City staff when addressing issues related to sex work.⁴
6. The City's actions in advocating for evidence-based and human rights approaches to inform national and local legislation. Such responses have been proven to increase the health, safety and dignity of sex workers, and to expand our ability to address issues of sex work in communities.⁵

Next steps:

City staff have been working to support WESWMC's efforts and we have identified a mutually-agreeable site for the memorial on Pendrell Street near the intersection of Jervis.

The Memorial will be sited directly in front of St. Paul's Anglican Church (1130 Jervis Street), which has endorsed the proposal.

¹ <http://vancouver.ca/people-programs/Health-and-safety-for-sex-workers.aspx>

² <http://former.vancouver.ca/ctyclerk/cclerk/20110922/documents/penv4.pdf>

³ <http://former.vancouver.ca/ctyclerk/cclerk/20131218/documents/cfsc7.pdf>

⁴ <http://vancouver.ca/files/cov/sex-work-response-guidelines.pdf>

⁵ <http://vancouver.ca/files/cov/City-of-vancouver-brief-bill-C-36-protection-communities-exploited-persons-act.pdf>

WESWMC has scheduled a public meeting on Wednesday November 4th from 7:00-9:00 pm at St. Paul's Anglican Church to which Council, community members, local non-profit organizations and the general public are invited.

In June 2015, the City Manager was briefed on both projects and acknowledged the negative impact of City actions to displace West End sex workers. A budget of \$100,000 was approved to recognize both the sex workers in the Downtown East Side and the West End, with the stipulation that \$30,000 of that budget was to be directed to the West End memorial project.

Planners have been working across City Departments and we look forward to the successful completion of the project sometime in 2016.

Sincerely...

Teresa Hartman,
A/Manager of Community Services

tel: 604..
fax: 604..

TH/
<none>

UPDATE ON WEST END SEX WORKERS MEMORIAL PROJECT (WESWMP)

APRIL 05, 2016 – **CONFIDENTIAL AND NOT FOR DISTRIBUTION**

Potential Key Project Date(s):

- May 3, 2016 – s.12(3)(b)
 - s.12(3)(b)
- June 15, 2016 – Council Committee
 - Public statement of apology and memorial
- June (?), 2016 – Public unveiling of memorial

Purpose: Concurrent process of apology and Installation of WESWMP memorial

- Council approval of apology statement and process
- Determine appropriate messaging around installation/unveiling of memorial and considerations for missing and murdered women memorial in DTES.

Background:

- July 2014: The committee members of the West End Sex Workers’ Memorial Project, Becki Ross and Jamie Lee Hamilton submitted a proposal to the Mayor, City Councillors, and City Manager for acknowledgement and action to address the mid-1980’s expulsion of sex workers from Vancouver’s West End.
 - Request: a memorial in the form of a lamp post near the intersection of Jervis and Pendrell Streets as well as a public apology.
 - The City has acknowledged past departmental actions that displaced individuals involved in street sex work and transferred sex work to other neighbourhoods, creating additional vulnerability and safety risks to sex workers and communities.

Date	Actions/ Progress
January – June 2015	Met with Committee numerous times and researched municipal records in City archives to confirm historical content in proposal.
June 2015	City Manager was briefed on this project and acknowledged the negative impact of City actions to displace West End sex workers. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Approval of \$100,000 approved to recognize both the sex workers in the Downtown East Side and the West End - \$30,000 to be directed to the West End memorial project.
August 2015	Staff from Social Policy, Culture and Engineering accompanied Committee members on a site visit and agreed on the location’s viability to accommodate a lamp post.
September 2015	Social Policy and Engineering staff discussed the process to purchase and install the memorial. CMM sent to Finance to request emerging priorities funds for both memorials.
November 2015	With support from City staff and St. Paul’s Anglican Church, located at the proposed site, the WESWMP held a community meeting to inform WE residents on the project.
December 2015	WESWMP Committee decided on design/configuration of lamp post. SP and Engineering staff discussed next steps re installation. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Two engineers assigned to project.
January 2016	SP staff extended community engagement/notification by distributing information letter to residents and businesses within a 2 block radius of memorial site as well as WE associations, neighbourhood houses, community centres and non-profits. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No inquiries/concerns received in the stated 2 week period.
February 2016	SP staff met with Legal and Communications to determine internal apology process
March 2016	SP and Legal met with GM and City Manager on apology, funding source and next steps <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • WESWMP Committee and staff to draft apology statement

Key Relevant Financial Information:

- Engineering will commence work on fabrication and installation of memorial upon release of funds.
 - Engineering set up an order/ WBS to track the costs and CS funding will be transferred as needed
OR can set up an order in CS and then Engineering can charge costs to this account.

Projected Costs:

Cost Item	2016 fiscal year
Community Engagement Process	
Purchase & modification of lamppost, including plaque	\$9,000
Installation (including base and electrical connection)	\$21,000
TOTAL COST	\$30,000

West End Sex Workers Memorial Event
Cost Schedule

	\$
Memorial pole	
Materials	13,128
Labour	6,769
Equipment charges	<u>2,823</u>
	<u>22,721</u>
Event	
Food & beverage	1,200
Honoraria	410
Other	<u>157</u>
	<u>1,767</u>
Total	<u>\$ 24,488</u>