

File No.: 04-1000-20-2020-086

April 29, 2020

s.22(1)

Dear s.22(1)

Re: **Request for Access to Records under the Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy Act (the "Act")**

I am responding to your request of for:

List of the eighty nine (89) outstanding recommendations from the Internal Audit Division's Presentation to Council of January 22, 2020, as noted on page 11.
<https://council.vancouver.ca/20200122/documents/cfsc1staffpresentation.pdf>

All responsive records are attached. Some information in the records has been severed, (blacked out), under s.14 and s.15(1)(l) of the Act. You can read or download this section here: http://www.bclaws.ca/EPLibraries/bclaws_new/document/ID/freeside/96165_00

Under section 52 of the Act, and within 30 business days of receipt of this letter, you may ask the Information & Privacy Commissioner to review any matter related to the City's response to your FOI request by writing to: Office of the Information & Privacy Commissioner, info@oipc.bc.ca or by phoning 250-387-5629.

If you request a review, please provide the Commissioner's office with: 1) the request number (#04-1000-20-2020-086); 2) a copy of this letter; 3) a copy of your original request; and 4) detailed reasons why you are seeking the review.

Yours truly,

Cobi Falconer, FOI Case Manager, ATIP, for

(Signature on File)

Barbara J. Van Fraassen, BA
Director, Access to Information & Privacy

Barbara.vanfraassen@vancouver.ca
453 W. 12th Avenue Vancouver BC V5Y 1V4

*If you have any questions, please email us at foi@vancouver.ca and we will respond to you as soon as possible. Or you can call the FOI Case Manager at 604.871.6584.

Encl.

:ma

Audit Name	Ref	Audit Recommendation
Non-Market Housing Operations (1/31/2012)	F.1.1	The Director of Facilities Design and Management, and the Director of Non-Market Operations should develop a service-level agreement to ensure maintenance service expectations are documented for the buildings operated by NMO. The service-level agreement should contain areas such as scope of responsibilities, response times, and costs of services. This should be in place by January 2013.
Non-Market Housing Operations (1/31/2012)	F.1.2	The Director of Facilities Design and Management, and the Director of Non-Market Operations should develop a process to regularly review and monitor service levels established in the FDM/NMO service-level agreement. This process should include review of high priority items for timely resolution. This should be in place by January 2013.
Cloud Computing Audit	F.1.1	The CIO should establish a cloud framework and strategy by July 2015.
Cloud Computing Audit	F.2.1	The CIO should develop a package for communication to City employees to educate them on cloud solutions and include step-by-step instructions and responsibilities by July 2015.
Vancouver Fire & Rescue Services Operational Audit	F.4.1	The Fire Chief should assess the type of asset management and tracking methodology best suited to control and manage inventory at VFRS that is efficient (easy to conduct – e.g. may be a bar code scan system) and effective (conducive for staff to perform their work). This should be reviewed and a way forward decision made by December 15, 2015.
Vancouver Fire & Rescue Services Operational Audit	F.6.1	The fire chief should ensure the needs of the training centre and vehicle service and maintenance yards are addressed adequately in the soon to be released fire hall Renewal Strategy study and act on it accordingly.
Social Media	F.3.1	The Director of Corporate Communications should ensure that an incident response plan for social media is formalized and implemented. This should be completed by December 31, 2016.

Audit Name	Ref	Audit Recommendation
Major Exhibiting Institutions	F.2.1	<p>The Managing Director of Cultural Services should ensure that the Collection Policies for all major exhibiting institutions are updated and approved by the City if required. The specific level of approval required should be clearly identified and documented.</p> <p>s.14 [REDACTED]</p> <p>[REDACTED] the draft Collection Policies and a timeline for final approval and issuance, should be obtained by December 31, 2016.</p>
PNE Internal Controls	F1.1	<p>The President and CEO, with support from the PNE senior management team, should establish a business continuity plan including procedures to resume core services and critical business processes in the event of a disruption. This should be completed by March 31, 2017.</p>
PNE Internal Controls	F1.2	<p>The President and CEO, with support from the PNE senior management team, should implement a formal risk management process (assuming allowable budget commitment) including a documented risk assessment outlining potential risks to PNE operations and mitigating action plans by November 30th, 2016. This should be updated on a minimum annual basis.</p>
PNE Internal Controls	F3.1	<p>The VP of Finance, with support from Corporate Services, should establish a procurement policy outlining appropriate procurement processes, and criteria for types of purchases that require an RFP. This should be completed by December 31st, 2016.</p>
CCTV Compliance Spot Audit	F.6	<p>s.14 [REDACTED]</p> <p>s.14 [REDACTED] to amend the policy to state that VPD is excluded from the "boards and commissions" per the policy to minimize any misunderstanding from readers. This should be completed by September 30, 2016.</p>
CCTV Compliance Spot Audit	F.8	<p>The City Clerk should finalize and sign-off the job description for the position of Director, Access to Information, with Human Resources. This should be completed by September 30, 2016.</p>

Audit Name	Ref	Audit Recommendation
CCTV Compliance Spot Audit	F.2	The Director, Access to Information, should work with the departmental GMs, or their designate to ensure that all CCTV operators are trained on FIPPA and all operating CCTVs have completed PIAs. This should be completed by December 31, 2016.
CCTV Compliance Spot Audit	F.4	The Director, Access to Information, should: a) Amend the CCTV application procedure to authorize the Director, Access to Information, to approve minor adjustments supported by valid business needs. The amendment should be approved by the City Manager; and b) PIAs should be completed for all CCTVs and put on file. This should be completed by December 31, 2016.
CCTV Compliance Spot Audit	F.5	The Director, Access to Information should consult with the Chief Information Officer/Chief Digital Officer and to establish an efficient CCTV application process in City Wire to assist city staff with their applications. This should be completed by December 31, 2016.
VPD-CCTV Compliance Spot Audit	F.4	The Senior Director, Information Services at VPD should work with Director, Access to Information, at the City to amend the policy to state that VPD is excluded from the "boards and commissions" per the policy to minimize any misunderstanding from readers. This should be completed by September 30, 2016.
VPD-CCTV Compliance Spot Audit	F.3	The Senior Director, Information Services, should assess its back up power supplies and take appropriate actions if longer operating periods are required. This should be completed before December 31, 2016 or be included with the 2017 capital budget review cycle.
Cyber Security Audit	F.4	The Chief Risk Officer should: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Complete a data classification scheme to adequately identify and protect data in information systems; and • Decide on encryption level protection for confidential information. This should start by December 31, 2016.

Audit Name	Ref	Audit Recommendation
Bylaw Enforcement Processes	F.2.1	The Chief Building Official should oversee the development of enhanced performance metrics and targets for the Integrated Enforcement Team to facilitate performance measurement and assist in management decision making. The new metrics should be in place by December 31, 2017.
Bylaw Enforcement Processes	F.2.2	The Director of Licensing, Property Use Inspections & Animal Services should oversee the development of enhanced performance metrics and targets for the bylaw enforcement staff to facilitate performance measurement and assist in management decision making. The new metrics should be in place by December 31, 2017.
Bylaw Enforcement Processes	F.3.3	The Chief Building Official, the Director of Licensing, Property Use Inspections & Animal Services, and the Director of Streets, should oversee the creation of a shared online resource for enforcement staff containing reference and training material for common skillsets and training areas among the departments. This should include but not be limited to s.14 s.14 s.14 This should be completed by December 31, 2017.
Privacy Management Audit	F1.1	The Director, Access to Information should formalize and implement a privacy policy to guide management and staff on appropriate handling of personal information collected at the City of Vancouver by March 31, 2018.
Privacy Management Audit	F1.2	The Director, Access to Information should communicate the privacy policy to management and staff to provide awareness of the requirements in the policy by March 31, 2018.

Audit Name	Ref	Audit Recommendation
Privacy Management Audit	F3.1	<p>The Director, Access to Information should formalize breach management protocols by September 30, 2017 through the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a) Document a comprehensive privacy breach incident response plan; b) Communicate to staff the requirement for all privacy breaches to be reported to the Access to Information office; c) Ensure that privacy breach incidents are documented and tracked in an incident log noting the severity and outcome of a privacy breach; and d) Implement a privacy breach checklist to guide staff on appropriate steps in responding to a privacy breach.
DCL Waiver	F.6.1	<p>The General Manager, Development, Building & Licensing should work with IT to investigate the possibility of developing reporting capabilities in POSSE on DCL waivers issued. It should also be investigated whether it is practical to eliminate the standalone system. This should be completed by July 31st, 2017.</p>
Cemetery Operations Audit	F.2	<p>The General Manager, Community Services, should establish a schedule where cemetery operations and issues are reviewed regularly. The focus should be on the cemetery's operation, budgeting and financial updates and actions to be taken as required. The City's DARCI Accountability Matrix to establish decision-making and accountability roles should be used to facilitate activities and projects in the cemetery. This schedule should be established as soon as practical by August 31, 2017.</p>
Cemetery Operations Audit	F.4	<p>The Cemetery Manager, working with the Cemetery Committee, should coordinate with the Long-term Finance Strategy and Planning group to examine the Cemetery's operation and projected revenue stream in relation to the CFF loan arrangement and borrowing rate. This would provide the Committee with an assessment of whether the current loan can be repaid and the cemetery can meet its goal of self-sufficiency in future. This review should be completed by 3Q 2017.</p>

Audit Name	Ref	Audit Recommendation
Cemetery Operations Audit	F.5	The Manager of Mountain View Cemetery should develop a process such as surveys and post-service critique forms to assess the level of service provided to clients. The results of these independent surveys should be shared with the Cemetery Committee and used as input for future operations and business development. This should be done by September 30, 2017.
Cemetery Operations Audit	F.1	The Manager, Mountain View Cemetery, working with the Cemetery Committee, should report the following to City Council by end of 4Q 2017: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - financial details on the actual performance as compared to the business plan and projection on Phase 1 costs; - the latest operating results; - status of governance and reporting; and - future plans for the cemetery with a recommendation for the next phase of its operation.
Payroll	F.2	The Director of Financial Services will work with the Chief Human Resource Officer to ensure that the process for loading and testing of new pay rates is formally documented for future testing. This should be completed by December 2018.
CAC Audit	F.2.1	F.2.1 The General Manager, Finance, Risk & Supply Chain Management, in consultation with the Planning and REFM departments, should clarify ownership of payment collection for phased CAC's, and ensure that adequate controls are in place such as entering holds in POSSE and tracking of phased payments. This should be completed by March 31, 2018, or when the City-wide CAC policy update is brought to Council.
CAC Audit	F.2.2	The Assistant Director, City-Wide & Regional Planning should ensure that the CAC Policy is updated to reflect the recent practice of phasing CAC cash payments. This should be completed by March 31, 2018, or when the City-wide CAC policy update is brought to Council.

Audit Name	Ref	Audit Recommendation
CAC Audit	F.2.3	<p>s.14 [REDACTED] s.14 [REDACTED] to establish a set of standardized payment terms (including options therein, to allow flexibility in negotiations) for future rezonings involving deferred CAC's. The Planning and Finance departments should be consulted as appropriate. This should be in place by March 31, 2018, or when the City-wide CAC policy update is brought to Council.</p>
CAC Audit	F.3.1	<p>The Assistant Director, City-Wide & Regional Planning should ensure that a process is implemented whereby all CAC exemptions granted receive review and approval by a specific management level staff, for example, Director-level. There should also be sufficient documentation retained to support the exemption granted. This should be completed by March 31, 2018, or when the City-wide CAC policy update is brought to Council.</p>
CAC Audit	F.3.2	<p>The Assistant Director, City-Wide & Regional Planning should ensure that the CAC policy clearly identifies the categories of CAC exemptions and that a process is established to ensure adequate review and correct application of CAC policy for more complex developments or those more ambiguous in nature.</p>
Property Endowment Fund Audit	E.4.1	<p>The GM of Real Estate & Facilities Management and the GM of Finance, Risk & Supply Chain Management/CFO are to ensure the PEF Performance Dashboard is regularly presented and reviewed to facilitate decision making. Ongoing improvements to the dashboard is also recommended. This should be completed March 31, 2018.</p>

Audit Name	Ref	Audit Recommendation
CAC Audit	F.5.1	<p>The Assistant Director, City-Wide & Regional Planning should consider limiting the locked-in period for CAC's to a maximum period such as one year, after which the CAC is either:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • adjusted to current rates (for target rate CAC's); • adjusted to account for changes in inflation and other market conditions (for negotiated CAC's); or • reopened for negotiation. <p>Any resulting changes should be reflected in the next update of the CAC Policy, expected by March 31, 2018.</p>
CAC Audit	F.6.1	<p>The Assistant Director, City-Wide & Regional Planning should determine whether the CAC policy should specifically address commercial developments and the treatment of associated CAC's. Consideration should be given to the demands placed on amenities in the area given the use of the building, as well as to promoting consistency and transparency in the approach to CAC negotiations.</p>
Parks Restaurant Leases Audit	E.2.1	<p>The Manager of Commercial Operations, Park Board and the Manager, Accounting Operations should document the roles and responsibilities of both departments involved with Parks restaurant leases. The areas should include, but not be limited to, those referred to above. It may be useful to extend this exercise to include all Parks leases and the relevant stakeholders, including Accounts Payable and REFM. A DARCI matrix should be used to document clear lines of accountability for all parts of the process. This document should be in place and agreed to by both departments by September 30, 2018.</p>

Audit Name	Ref	Audit Recommendation
Parks Restaurant Leases Audit	E.3.1	<p>The Park Board Commercial Operations team, in consultation with the Facilities and Accounting departments, should verify the accuracy of the current utilities billings by:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. reviewing current billings and verifying that all utilities costs are being recovered as appropriate; and b. maintaining information for each lease as to the arrangements for utilities payments and any billings that are required to recover costs. <p>This should be in place by December 31, 2018.</p>
Parks Restaurant Leases Audit	E.4.1	<p>The Manager of Commercial Operations, Park Board should ensure that a process is established whereby special events held by restaurants are recorded, and reported annually to the Accounts Receivable department for their reconciliation to fees paid. This should be completed by September 30, 2018.</p>
Software Licence Audit	E.1.1	<p>The Chief Technology Officer should develop a communication package for City employees to educate them on the use and purchase of cloud software. The package should be communicated to staff by July 2019.</p>
Software Licence Audit	E.2.1	<p>The Chief Procurement Officer should establish a central repository for software licence contracts and supporting information. This should be completed by January 2019</p>
Software Licence Audit	E.3.1	<p>The Chief Technology Officer should develop a communication package for City employees to educate staff on software purchases. The package should be communicated to staff by July 2019.</p>
Software Licence Audit	E.4.1	<p>The Chief Technology Officer should ensure that the manually installed software inventory is updated and includes details of current licence entitlement numbers, and the name and location of the asset or user associated with the licence. This information could be combined with the central software licence repository recommended in Recommendation E.2 by July 2019.</p>

Audit Name	Ref	Audit Recommendation
Software Licence Audit - VPL	E.1.1	The Director of Collections and Technology should develop a communication package for employees to educate them on the use and purchase of cloud software. The package should be communicated to staff by July 2019.
Software Licence Audit - VPL	E.2.1	The Director of Collections and Technology should develop a communication package for VPL employees to educate staff on software purchases. The package should be communicated to staff by July 2019.
Sick Without Pay Benefits Audit	E.1.1	The Director, HR Business Partnerships should work with the Director of Financial Services to establish responsibility for benefits cancellation by January 2019.
Sick Without Pay Benefits Audit	E.1.2	The Director, HR Business Partnerships should work with the Director of Financial Services to clearly document and communicate the benefits cancellation process including key dates and timeframes used for reminders sent prior to cancelling benefits by January 2019.
Sick Without Pay Benefits Audit	E.1.3	The Director of Financial Services, until such time as the ownership of this process is determined, should ensure that the benefits cancellation templates are finalized and used by Payroll clerks with minimal edits to items such as names, dates and amounts by January 2019.
Sick Without Pay Benefits Audit	E.2.1	The Director of Financial Services, until such time as the ownership of this process is determined, should ensure that the benefits arrears process is formalized and communicated to staff with clearly defined repayments guidelines and parameters by January 2019.
Sick Without Pay Benefits Audit	E.3.1	The Director, HR Business Partnerships should implement a quarterly audit of processes that involve employees paying benefits to ensure benefits are paid for appropriately. This process should start by January 2019.

Audit Name	Ref	Audit Recommendation
Inventory Management Audit	E1.1	The Senior Manager of SCM Operations should establish a SCM Warehouse & Inventory Operations department guideline outlining roles, responsibility and accountability around storage of inventory. The criteria to define stock and non-stock inventory should also be established to ensure inventory is treated properly. This should be completed, communicated to all key stakeholders and implemented by March 31, 2019.
Inventory Management Audit	E.3.1	The Senior Manager of SCM Operations should ensure individual labels are created for all indoor and outdoor inventory, as reasonable. This should be done for all inventory on hand and all new inventory that will be received going forward. This should be completed by June 30, 2019.
Inventory Management Audit	E.4.4	The Senior Manager of SCM Operations should ensure the SAP Stockout Report that summarizes stockout frequency of all inventory is developed and reviewed monthly. It is also important to ensure appropriate parameter changes are made subsequently. This should be completed by March 31, 2019.
Inventory Management Audit	E.6.3	The Manager of Inventory and Warehouse Operations (Division B) and the VFRS Assistant Chief of Training & Professional Development, HUSAR should create individual barcode labels that are compatible with D4H for all HUSAR deployment containers. This should be completed by June 30, 2019.
Inventory Management Audit	E.6.4	The Manager of Inventory and Warehouse Operations (Division B) and the VFRS Assistant Chief of Training & Professional Development, HUSAR should review the compatibility of the current QR codes being used on the HUSAR communications equipment and Search and Rescue staff identification passes to D4H software. If the QR codes cannot be compatible with D4H, new barcodes should be used for communications equipment and Search and Rescue staff identification passes. It is also important to ensure all barcodes used for HUSAR inventory tracking is compatible with D4H and that staff is fully trained in order to use system with barcodes. This should be completed by June 30, 2019.

Audit Name	Ref	Audit Recommendation
TTC Inventory Review	C.1.1	Create a Standard Operating Procedure to establish policies for the storage and management s.15(1)(l) s.15(1)(l) Outline roles and responsibilities between the TTC and the VPD in relation to inventory management, and consider the Natural Resources Canada storage s.15(1)(l) (see Appendix 1).
TTC Inventory Review	C.1.2	Compile a complete database of all contracts signed with the active third party agencies and sign new contracts as necessary.
TTC Inventory Review	C.1.3	Establish a system to track all contract expiries and manage renewals prior to expiry.
TTC Inventory Review	C.1.4	Contact all inactive third party agencies to ask how they would like to proceed with their inventory s.15(1)(l) s.15(1)(l) Consider having a two-month deadline before s.15(1)(l) is considered as forfeited by third parties.
TTC Inventory Review	C.1.5	Update the TTC Facility Use Agreement to include an s.15(1)(l) forfeiture s.15(1)(l) s.15(1)
TTC Inventory Review	C.2.1	Establish and implement a standard labelling system for inventory that would not be affected by the removal of shrink wrap. Consider using a sticker label on the pallet base. (See Appendix 2 for sample label).
TTC Inventory Review	C.2.2	Management has committed to installing computers in each storage room to manage all inventory movement. Management should consider utilizing an inventory management software to integrate into the overall process (i.e. off-the-shelf software or SAP). Meanwhile, management should establish proper processes to ensure the inventory records are accurate.
TTC Inventory Review	C.2.3	Monthly reconciliations should be performed for the following to verify completeness: <input type="checkbox"/> Inventory sold by VPD to TTC – all sales should be reconciled between the database and SAP journal entries. <input type="checkbox"/> Inventory sold by TTC to third party agencies – all sales should be reconciled between the database and invoices issued.

Audit Name	Ref	Audit Recommendation
TTC Inventory Review	C.2.4	A reconciliation needs to be performed to determine how much inventory was transferred from VPD to TTC and if the related payments were made by TTC.
TTC Inventory Review	C.2.5	Segregate inventory by ownership so: s.15(1)(l)
TTC Inventory Review	C.2.6	Assign location numbers to shelves in the storage rooms to properly track inventory location.
TTC Inventory Review	C.2.7	Carts should not be used to hold inventory and should be empty when they are not being used to transport s.15(1)(l) s.15(1) At the end of the training session, s.15(1)(l) s.15(1)(l) should be returned to shelves and updated in the inventory database.
TTC Inventory Review	C.2.8	s.15(1)(l) owned by different third party agencies should be physically segregated, divided (e.g. locked cages) and labelled individually.
TTC Inventory Review	C.2.9	s.15(1)(l) from third parties should only be performed by authorized TTC staff. If more staff coverage is required, there should be a limited number of authorized personnel that is trained on the process. Related procedures and authorized staff should all be documented in the Standard Operating Procedure.
TTC Inventory Review	C.2.10	s.15(1)(l) inventory transfers with third party agencies must be documented and signed by both the TTC staff and third party agency. Purchases should have email correspondence and inventory used should be initialled by third parties.
TTC Inventory Review	C.2.11	TTC staff should perform monthly inventory counts of TTC inventory and third party inventory.
TTC Inventory Review	C.3.1	Establish a process around creating and issuing spare access cards and ensure it is documented in the Standard Operating Procedure.
TTC Inventory Review	C.3.2	Storage room access and inventory management should be restricted to the minimum number of staff needed.

Audit Name	Ref	Audit Recommendation
TTC Inventory Review	C.3.3	Management should perform monthly reviews of storage room access logs for s.15(1)(l) [REDACTED]
TTC Inventory Review	C.3.4	s.15(1)(l) [REDACTED] inventory should be removed from the s.15(1)(l) [REDACTED] storage rooms.
TTC Inventory Review	C.3.5	Both the TTC Planning and Safety Supervisor and TTC Manager s.15(1)(l) [REDACTED]
TTC Inventory Review	C.3.6	s.15(1)(l) [REDACTED]
TTC Inventory Review	C.4.1	s.15(1)(l) [REDACTED] in storage room #2.
Homelessness Services Outreach Audit	E.4.1	The Director, Homelessness Services should follow up with BC Housing and obtain access to metrics information for all Outreach metrics outlined in the joint BC Housing agreement. This should be completed by December 31, 2018.
Homelessness Services Outreach Audit	E.8.1	The Director, Homelessness Services should document internal purchasing guidelines on acceptable purchases within Outreach and have them approved by the GM, ACCS. This should be in place by December 31, 2018.
Property Tax Process Audit	E.3.2	The Director of Financial Services should ensure knowledge of the property tax calculations and validations is documented and cross-trained with other staff to ensure coverage by August 2019.
Property Tax Process Audit	E.4.1	The Director of Financial Services should look into improving the multi-year supplementary rolls upload into Tempest by submitting an enhancement request to the Tempest software vendor. A “wizard” like software feature or more automated approach would improve efficiency. This request should be submitted by January 2019.
Health and Safety Compliance Audit	E.2.3	The Director, Organizational Health and Safety, should update its training module and maintain it for use by all business units anticipated to use contractors. The update should be completed by June 30, 2019 and maintained on an ongoing basis.

Audit Name	Ref	Audit Recommendation
Health and Safety Compliance Audit	E.4.1	The Director of Organizational Health and Safety, Human Resources, should ensure responsibilities for safety training are communicated and shared by all City Department operations. General Managers and the CHRO, or delegates, should ensure all required initial and ongoing safety training is developed and incorporated into all employees' work schedules . This should start as soon as possible or by/before June 30, 2019.
Health and Safety Compliance Audit	E.5.1	The Fire Chief should initiate a review of the above items with the aim of developing a plan to address them and setting target dates for their resolution. Where issues have been addressed, periodic reassessments should be taken to ensure they still meet current requirements. The review should start immediately and an action plan be prepared by March 31, 2019.
Health and Safety Compliance Audit	E.6.1	The General Manager of Real Estate and Facilities Management should work with other City departments and outside agencies to update the City's property list with the aim of determining the ownership and responsibility for their maintenance, capital replacement and safety requirements. Formal agreements should be drafted for all City operated facilities to ensure responsibility and accountability for these properties is assigned. This process should start immediately (updated from the current list), and maintained on an ongoing basis.