



CITY OF VANCOUVER
Community Services Group
Current Planning

First Shaughnessy Advisory Design Panel

Minutes of the Meeting of August 31, 2006

QUORUM

Present:

Beth Noble, Vice-Chair	Resident - SHPOA Member
Kilby Gibson	Resident Member at Large
Kathy Reichert	Resident Member at Large
Michael Roburn	Resident - SHPOA Member
Carole Walker Angus	Resident - SHPOA Member
Stewart McIntosh	BCSLA
Derek Neale	AIBC
Richard Keate	Heritage Commission Representative

Regrets/Absences:

Barbara Campney	Resident Member at Large
Maureen Molaro	Resident - SHPOA Member
Michelle McMaster	BCSLA
Steve Palmier	AIBC
Judy Ross	Real Estate Board of Greater Vancouver

Recording Secretary: Katherine Reichert

City Staff: Sailen Black, Development Planner, UDDPC

AGENDA

Business:

1. Review of the Minutes of August 10, 2006
2. Recent Projects Update

Address: 1609 Cedar Crescent
Applicant: Ron Van Der Eerden, Pacific Image Home Design
Description: New single-family dwelling and garage on vacant site
Application: First

NOTE: The packages of reduced materials for this project were couriered out for the last meeting of August 10, 2006.

I. Business

1. **Minutes of August 10, 2006** were reviewed, and the Motions need to be separated from the regular text. Moved by Richard Keate and approved.
2. **Project updates: None**
3. **New Business:**
 - **New FSAD Panel Members:** Perspective members to the FSADP may come as guests to observe the meetings but not participate. City clerk will take applications and hold onto them until a vacancy opens.
 - **Thank you letter** submitted by Richard Keate for Robert Miranda distributed to all FSAD Panel members and they agreed to send it. Sailen Black will ask about putting the letter on the City letterhead.

Address: 1609 Cedar Crescent
Applicant: Ron Van Der Eerden, Pacific Image Home Design
Description: New single-family dwelling and garage on vacant site
Application: First

Program:

Ron Van Der Eerden explained that this is a difficult site to build on. The shape and constraints of the lot dictate the house location and the garage location. The house is designed to keep in the simplicity of neighbours and to match the Georgian Theme along 16th Avenue.

Panel Questions:

- Explain the landscape plan. It will be symmetrical, keep a lot of lawn space and as many existing shrubs as possible particularly along 16th Avenue and the western border of the lot.
- What are the exterior spaces used for? Besides the grass, two patios are present, one for the front of the house and the other off the family room.
- Do you plan to save the existing outside walls? Yes
- Where will the cement-coated foam be used? It will be applied with thinset and used on all the horizontal bands of the house as well as surrounding the windows.
- Will the window bands be of the same texture? Yes
- Are the windows true divided lights? Yes
- Is there a west fence? No, but there are cedars planted and existing shrubs. A fence may be needed.
- Will there be any stone on the front of the house? No it will be changed to stucco and cement coated foam.
- What colour will the house be? Grant Beige
- Does the base of the house use any different material? No, the front of the house does not have much of a base because it is at grade.
- What colour is the garage door? Dark Brown
- The garage door will stand out. Would it not be better to draw less attention to it by painting it a different colour? It is a garage door so we did not feel the need to hide it.
- Does the stucco go all the way into the foundation? The stucco will go as close to the base as possible.
- Why not use wood trim on the windows? The cement-coated foam can be cut to any length and is easier to use.
- If trying to replicate stone, why not use it? Limestone is expensive and has leaking issues.
- Is the smooth stucco used in other Shaughnessy homes? Yes and the smooth stucco adds to the style of this house.

Planning Comments:

First, the model received this week was very helpful, not only for this meeting but in staff evaluation of the project. Second, to review site constraints: placement of vehicle entry is effectively limited to somewhere along Cedar Crescent; and due to the depth of the site the proponent has chosen to seek a relaxation of required front yard, which the Director of Planning will consider including the effect on FSD principles.

In this case Director of Planning is concerned over design choices made which result in vehicle maneuvering not normally permitted in the required front yard, the extensiveness of hard surfacing to support the maneuvering, and the alteration of existing topography through back fill to create a new plateau for the cars.

As members of the Panel expressed at the preliminary inquiry, we are also concerned about the garage. Although the site constraints rule out lane access, we are concerned that the proposed design compromises FSD principles that streetscapes include the entryway as a major focus with automobile-oriented uses relegated to a secondary role. Clearly it will be closer to the street than normal; however, we wonder if locating double width doors at the highest point on the site, in front of the main entry, and within the most prominent façade is the best solution in this case.

It is our understanding that the intent of the fibre cement-coated foam is to imitate stone detailing. Despite the cost savings offered by cement-coated foam detailing, the extent and variety of foam-based beltlines, window sills, jambs and other features on this project is of concern given FSD principle for authenticity of materials and the potential that over application may produce more dramatically textured and plastic work than that seen in pre-1940 houses.

In conclusion, we are looking for Panel comments on proposed architecture and landscape, especially the composition of the elevation, the design of the roof, location of the garage, the landscape of the front yard, the use of cement-coated foam, and the tripartite expression achieved.

Panel Comments:

- Like the massing, rooflines and the siting of the house.
- The garage is in a good location.
- More prominence needs to be added to the front of the house, perhaps front steps.
- Consider interlocking pavers for the driveway.
- Concern over the use of the cement coated foam and the painting of it to look like stone.
- There is a lack of contrast between the texture of the stucco and the window frames.
- Roof needs to be stronger with the use of slate or tiles rather than asphalt.
- Need to give the base more prominence with ground aggregate or a similar material and may need to raise the house.
- The main window on the south elevation is exposed so possibly need to add some drainage.
- Needs tripartite expression where the base is more prominent.
- Smooth stucco is not in keeping with First Shaughnessy.
- Having no windows on the east side shows respect for the neighbours.
- Use authentic materials, not cement coated detailing.
- Reduce the prominence of the garage doors by changing the paint colour.
- A lot of variation in the window sizes and number of divided lights, need to be consistent.
- The front door is lost and does not have much of a presence.
- More details of which plants will be used around the base of the house is needed.
- How well does the cement-coated foam age? Reluctant to approve because unaware of its history.
- French style is great.
- The balcony on the north elevation detracts from the view of the house.
- The arched front door is lower than the elevation of the living room doors and does not look right.
- Perhaps have arched double doors on the living room.
- South East lower window could be removed.
- Could incorporate the hall window above with the front doors to make this a more prominent part of the house.
- Arbors needed.

- Lengthen the windows on the north elevation to keep proportions with the rest of the house.
- Not sure that you need to resort to cement-coated foam.
- I support the site relaxations.
- Question the authenticity of materials used and will it last 100 years like other Shaughnessy homes. Need to stay true to the stone look with real stone.
- Smooth stucco and asphalt not in keeping with the rest of Shaughnessy.
- What if the living room became the garage?
- Use separate landscape to break the garage from the front door area.
- Explore the options of other materials.
- Keep the trees on the northeast corner of the lot.
- Reorient front landscape so that it is not so busy looking.
- Keep landscape in axis with the house.
- Windowpanes need to be the same size.
- Use cement-coated foam with restraint.
- Look to Robert Stern House Book. The North York, Ontario section in the back of the book shows a fine example of a French Chateau Style.

Planning Question:

- Asked whether nearby homes are plaster stucco with smooth finish (typical of older homes) or acrylic stucco with sand float texture.

Applicants Remarks:

The house next door is smooth stucco as well as a nearby home across the street. We can work on the details of the house.

Motion:

To have the applicant return with FSAD Panel comments addressed.

Moved by Stewart McIntosh; seconded by Carole Walker Angus: passed unanimously

Additional Comments:

The house is at its maximum height.

The meeting adjourned a 5:40 pm.