

Chinatown Legacy Stewardship Group (LSG) 6th Meeting Meeting Summary Notes

Date: Wednesday, January 22, 2020
Time: 5:30 p.m. – 7:30 p.m.
Location: Chinese Cultural Center, 50 E Pender (Boardroom, 2nd Floor)

Present: Alain Chow, Anita (Chan) Bardal 陳維英, Aynsley Wong Meldrum, Bill Kwok, Charlotte Li, Elisha Yao, Fred Mah, Glynnis Chan, Inge Roecker, Jordan Eng, Jugen Li, Kimberley Wong 黃壯慈, Leslie Shieh, Yu Rong Li 李玉榮, Louis Lapprend, Michael Sing Yau Tan 譚聖祐, Robert Sung, Ross Lam, Sonny Wong, Stephanie Leo, Susan Ma, Terry Hunter, Wang Zhao, Y Vy Truong

Guests: Alisha Masongsong (Co-Chair of Low-Income Working Group), Aaron Lao (Vancouver Plan), Jason Hsieh (Vancouver Plan), Jose Fernandez Garcia (City of Vancouver), 2 seniors (CCG), Sarah Ling (REC Working Group), Henry Yu (UBC)

Staff: Wendy Au, Baldwin Wong, Helen Ma, Helen Lee, Joseph Li, Belle Cheung, Aaron Lao, Alan Chen (Chinatown Transformation Team /CTT), Tiffany Zhang (Interpreter)

Regrets: Carmut Me, Cecil Charles Chi Chung Fung, Danny Quon, Jun Ing, Kevin Huang 黃儀軒, Laiwan Chung, Mark Lee, Michelle Fu, Minna Van, To Trinh Diep, Vincent Kwan, William Ma, Willie Chan, Will Tao, Susie Steinmetz (Province of BC)

Agenda

Time	Item	Presenter/Facilitator
5:30 p.m.	Welcome and introduction of new members <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Revisit community guidelines 	Kimberley Wong and Mike Tan LSG Co-chair
5:45 p.m.	Working group updates	Working group sponsors
6:00 p.m.	Report back on Chinatown community values	Helen Ma Co-lead, Chinatown Transformation Team
6:10 p.m.	Vancouver Plan introduction	Jason Hsieh Planner, Vancouver Plan
6:30 p.m.	Looking ahead at 2020: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Priorities and milestones 2020 meeting dates Meeting venue ideas Spring LSG open house 	Baldwin Wong and Helen Ma Co-leads, Chinatown Transformation Team
7:00 p.m.	Ice breaker activity	Kimberley Wong and Mike Tan LSG Co-chair
7:30 p.m.	Meeting Adjourned	Kimberley Wong and Mike Tan LSG Co-chair

1. Welcome new members

- New members:
 - Anita Bardal – family on father’s side grew up in Chinatown
 - Charlotte Li –architect, has projects in the Downtown Eastside area
 - Inge Roecker – work, live and volunteer in Chinatown for 15 years
 - June Chow / Susan Ma – Youth Collaborative for Chinatown
 - Louis Lappend – Founder of Chinatown Today
 - Robert Sung – Chinatown Tour Guide and Owner
- Revisit community guidelines

2. Working group updates by sponsors

- Relationship-Building, Education and Public Awareness, Capacity-Building - expressed interest in working on relationships with Indigenous communities – MST & Urban Indigenous.
- Small Business & Economic Development –Group talked about opportunities and threats that businesses are facing. Now focusing on short and long-term initiatives.
 - Short – store-front criteria; incentivizing new or legacy businesses.
 - Long – business-retail strategy to define retail character; culinary strategy; sustainable funding models; helping societies activate their vacant storefronts
 - Regarding recent closures –talked about initiating a legacy business program, acknowledged that many businesses didn’t have a succession plan which makes situation very challenging.
- Cultural Heritage –Developing a Cultural & Heritage Charter, describing cultural protections for Chinatown, modelled after Granville Island’s cultural protections. Identified 6 areas of work: intangible heritage, tangible heritage, language, culinary heritage, cultural business, and storytelling. Will be identifying projects within these areas.
- Safety and streets: No report back
- Low-income– Developed principles and objectives, as well as ideas for short, medium, and long-term strategies
 - 3 principles of work:
 - 1. The seniors will be supported to directly advocate for themselves;
 - 2. We will examine issues from the perspective of seniors and Indigenous people;
 - 3. We will support relationships and understanding between seniors and Indigenous people – we can pursue our rights directly by looking out for each other and working towards solutions together.
 - Group objectives:
 - 1. Build a strong community fabric to create a stronger sense of connection, understanding and hope.
 - 2. Improve the quality of life and living conditions of residents.
 - 3. Create awareness through public education about anti-racism, anti-Asian racism, decolonization, and develop strategies for poverty reduction.
 - 4. Support capacity-building broadly for seniors in the community.

3. Report back on Chinatown community values - Sarah Ling

“What is our responsibility, for those of us who are not Indigenous, to learn to become better visitors on unceded lands?”

- REC WG conducted a survey at the LSG social last year to assess familiarity with key initiatives from the municipal, provincial, and federal levels regarding Indigenous relationship building amongst LSG members.
- Also wanted to gauge the LSG’s needs and interests in engaging with Indigenous people and issues.
- The LSG’s scope includes relationship-building with the Indigenous communities because the UNESCO World Heritage Site Designation needs to understand and consider the impact of UNESCO on the Indigenous communities of the area (host nations and urban Indigenous in DTES).
- The survey will support a plan to help us work together to increase our awareness, understanding and education.
- See the attached PPT for survey results.
- Themes and examples from the survey responses collected
 - Interested in learning more about...
 - Indigenous and Asian-Canadian relations, historical and contemporary
 - Interest in exploring Chinatown and First Nations organizational collaboration opportunities
 - Actionable tools improve relationships
 - Opportunities for dialogue, Dialogues Project
 - What are the best ways to engage with Indigenous peoples/communities?
 - How do we move beyond discussion and improve living circumstances for Indigenous peoples?
 - How does Indigenous engagement connect with Chinatown work?
 - Non-Chinese settler - Reconciliation looks different for different communities. How can we understand this better in relation to Indigenous peoples?
 - Our survival is connected.
 - As leaders in the community, part of our responsibilities should include identifying instances where Indigenous communities should be included or consulted in our work.

4. Vancouver Plan Introduction – Jason Hsieh

“What needs to happen in the Vancouver Plan to support Chinatown?”

- How can the LSG support us?
 - Take our online survey
 - Currently participants are overrepresented by the internet-literate, English speakers, etc. We want more diverse participation.
 - We also have a team of canvassers who can come to your events and help people fill out the survey
 - Host a dialogue circle

- We want community conversations, and the city can support these. Tell us your needs: we can bring food, interpreters, rent space for you, etc.
- Connect us with your organizations

5. Chinatown-Indigenous Relations Strategy Introduction – Baldwin Wong

- Chinatown is on the unceded territories of the First Nations. It is very important that we understand our relations to our Indigenous neighbors.
- *Watched Instructional Video for newcomers, from Kamala Todd, Indigenous Cultural Planner with CoV (commissioned by the Immigrant Service Society of BC)*
- Our work as the LSG emerged from discussions around the Historical Discrimination against Chinese People. There are many parallels between the Chinese and Indigenous communities suffering against discrimination, to this day.
- We need to ask the Indigenous communities “do you want to engage with us?” as a first step. If they express interest, there’s lots of work we can explore together.
 - In terms of Chinatown – how do we relate to the Indigenous people living here? Do we know who they are? Do they know us? Do we know of each other’s experiences?
- Modelled after the Vancouver Dialogues project from 2010 (funded by the Federal government):
 - “Dialogue Circles” were set up with a small number of people in each, where each person shares stories of their experiences and aspirations for the future.
 - We will be looking for host organizations from the LSG and Chinatown, and also organizations from the Indigenous side to see if they are interested in hosting their own dialogue circles.
- CTT will keep the LSG posted on continued progress on this area.

6. Looking ahead at 2020:

- Chinatown Community Values:
 - Please review the most recent version (see attached) and provide any feedback to CTT.
 - We will continue refining them and integrated into the final CHAMP document.
- Please see attached document for 2019 completed projects, 2020 priorities and milestones.

7. Ice breaker activity – Hat of Fears

- Participants will write down a fear they have related to Chinatown and drop it into the hat.
- Each person will draw one out, read it, and relate them to our own experiences.
- List of fears:
 - Gentrification. There will not be enough safe and affordable housing for our residents, including affordable storefronts
 - Social and economic implosion
 - The pigeon population is out of control
 - Affordable housing and affordable cultural business will become displaced by surrounding development projects (St. Paul’s, etc.)

- On a community and interpersonal level, we let our ego get in the way of meaningful collaboration
- I'm afraid that in 10 years, Chinatown will look like Yaletown with a couple of Chinese names added to glass towers
- Chinese characters (store names) for storefronts, but where's the Chinatown?
- Loss of community due to gentrification
- The free market forces will gentrify Chinatown before this LSG process ends, and the City can't do anything about it (the Mayor and City Councillors are working hard to protect residential tenancy, but there are few tools the City has to protect commercial tenants)
- To be overwhelmed, inundated by DTES.
- Gentrification/ Not having control over what storefronts move into Chinatown is maybe what gives us that fear of gentrification.
- Fear that younger generations don't have a purpose to come to Chinatown.
- Loss of history and culture
- Chinatown used to be home to the Cantonese and Toisanese dialects, but now they've disappeared.
- Traditional businesses will disappear in the future
- Extinction of Chinatown
- That Chinatown will become all bars and coffee shops
- New Chinatown businesses not acknowledging that they are a part of the community
- My kids will not be able to connect with the community and their Toishan heritage
- Gentrification

8. Meeting Adjourned

**唐人街文化傳承督導組
第六次會議記錄摘要**

日期： 2020年1月22日(星期三)
時間： 下午5時30分 – 7時30分
地點： 片打東街50號中華文化中心會議廳

出席成員： Alain Chow, 陳維英Anita (Chan) Bardal . Aynsley Wong Meldrum . 郭瑋霖Bill Kwok . Charlotte Li, Elisha Yao . 馬清石Fred Mah, 陳開心Glynnis Chan, Inge Roecker 伍沛雄Jordan Eng . 李菊根 Jugen Li, 黃壯慈Kimberley Wong, 謝麗如 Leslie Shieh, 李玉榮 Ru Rong Li, Louis Lapprend, 譚聖祐Michael Sing Yau Tan, Robert Sung, Ross Lam, 黃仕儒Sonny Wong, 廖綺媚Stephanie Leo, Susan Ma, Terry Hunter, 王墨 Wang Zhao . Y Vy Truong

來賓： Alisha Masongsong (低收入工作小組共同主席), Aaron Lao (溫哥華計劃), Jason Hsieh (溫哥華計劃), Jose Fernandez Garcia (溫哥華市政府), 2 位長者嘉賓 (唐人街關注組), 凌慧意 Sarah Ling (卑詩大學), 余全毅Henry Yu (卑詩大學)

市府職員： 區韻宜 Wendy Au, 黃永安 Baldwin Wong, 馬凱盈Helen Ma, 李麗芳 Helen Lee, 李光耀Joseph Li, 張芷彤Belle Cheung, 劉子亨Aaron Lao, 陳曉征Alan Chen (唐人街經濟文化發展專案小組 (CTT), Tiffany Zhang (翻譯員)

缺席成員： 米加密 Carmut Me, Cecil Charles Chi Chung Fung, Danny Quon, 吳俊譽Jun Ing . 黃儀軒Kevin Huang . Laiwan Chung 陳德聰Mark Lee, Michelle Fu, Minna Van, To Trinh Diep, Vincent Kwan, 馬威廉William Ma, 陳耀輝Willie Chan, 陶唯Will Tao, Susie Steinmetz (卑詩省政府)

議程：

時間	項目	主持人
5:30 p.m.	歡迎及介紹新成員 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 重新審視社區指引 	黃壯慈/譚聖祐 督導組共同主席
5:45 p.m.	工作小組最新資訊	工作小組發起人
6:00 p.m.	唐人街社區價值研究報告	馬凱盈 唐人街經濟文化發展專案小組 共同領導
6:10 p.m.	「溫哥華計劃」介紹	Jason Hsieh 「溫哥華計劃」規畫師
6:30 p.m.	2020年前瞻： <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 首要事項及里程碑 2020年會議日期 會議地點建議 督導會春季開放日 	黃永安/馬凱盈 唐人街經濟文化發展專案小組 共同領導
7:00 p.m.	交誼活動	黃壯慈/譚聖祐 督導組共同主席
7:30 p.m.	會議結束	黃壯慈/譚聖祐 督導組共同主席

1. 歡迎新委任督導組成員

- 新成員：
 - Anita Bardal – 父親的家庭在唐人街成長
 - Charlotte Li – 建築師，工程在市中心東端
 - Inge Roecker – 過去15年在唐人街工作、生活及當義工

- June Chow / Susan Ma – 「青心在唐人街」組織
- Louis Lapprend – 「Chinatown Today」創辦人
- Robert Sung – 唐人街導賞團導遊及負責人
- 重新審視社區指引

2. 工作小組最新資訊

- 建立關係工作小組 – 表示有興趣與原住民社區 (包括馬斯琴、史廣米殊及史利華圖部族及市區原住民)建立關係。
- 小型商業及經濟發展工作小組 – 談及唐人街商戶面對的商機及威脅，目前正在集中於長、短期的計劃。
 - 短期 – 店面標準：為新設及傳統商戶提供誘因。
 - 長期 – 藉著商業零售策略界定零售業的特質：飲食業策略、可持續的撥款模式：協助社團活化他們的空置店舖。
 - 有關最近關閉的店舖，工作小組建議引入一個傳統商業計劃，但礙於缺乏承繼生意的計劃，令情況出現挑戰。
- 文化遺產 – 以固蘭湖島文化保育計劃為藍本，為保護唐人街的文化制訂一份文化遺產憲章。定下了包括非物質文化遺產、物質文化遺產、語言、飲食文化傳統、文化商業及故事講述等6個工作範疇，並在這些領域內制定有關計劃。
- 公共安全和街道：沒有報告事項
- 低收入居民工作小組 – 已制定工作原則和目標，以及長、中、短期的策略
 - 3項工作原則：
 - 1.向長者作出支援以直接保護他們的權益
 - 2.從長者及原住民的角度探討議題
 - 3.支持長者與原住民之間建立關係及增加了解 – 我們可以互相扶持及一同解決問題以爭取我們的權益
 - 小組目標：
 1. 建立強大的社區組織以增強聯繫、了解和希望。
 2. 改善居民的生活質素及生活環境。
 3. 透過公共教育增加對反種族歧視、反亞裔歧視、非殖民化及制定削減貧窮策略等議題的認識。
 4. 為社區內的長者增強組織能力。

3. 唐人街社區價值的報告 – 凌慧意

“對於並非是原住民的人來說，我們要負上甚麼責任學習成為這片未經割讓土地上更好的客人？”

- 建立關係工作小組在去年的交誼活動上做了一項問卷調查，以了解督導組成員是否認識三級政府在原住民人權及關係上的主要項目。
- 同時亦希望知道各位督導組成員在聯繫原住民及有關議題上的需求及興趣。
- 由於申遺計劃要求考慮到世界文化遺產的地位對本區原住民做成的影響，所以督導組的工作範疇包括了與原住民社區建立關係(市中心東端的民族及市區原住民)
- 這項調查有助制定一項能夠讓我們合作以增加對市中心東端的認識、明白及教育的計劃。
- 請參閱附上文件的調查結果
- 一些回答問卷的例子：
 - 有興趣知道更多關於...
 - 原住民與亞裔加人以往和現在的關係
 - 有興趣探討唐人街和原住民組織之間的合作機會
 - 可改善關係的行動工具
 - 對話的機會 (例如「對話」計劃)
 - 那些是聯繫原住民的最佳方法?
 - 除了進行討論之外，我們還可以怎樣改善原住民社區的生活環境?
 - 如何把聯繫原住民與唐人街的工作連結起來？
 - 非華裔的定居者 – 不同的社區對和解有不同的觀感，我們可以怎樣對原住民的看法有更深的體會？
 - 我們的生存是連在一起的。
 - 作為社區領袖，我們有責任確保原住民社區能夠參與及被包括在我們的工作之中。

4. 「溫哥華計劃」簡介 – Jason Hsieh

“「溫哥華計劃」怎樣才可以為唐人街提供支援？”

- 督導組可以怎樣支持我們？
 - 填寫問卷調查

- 目前大部份參與者都是懂得使用電腦及能說英語的人士。我們希望有更多元化的人士參與。
- 我們亦有工作人員可以到你們舉辦活動的地方協助填寫問卷。
 - 舉行一個「對話圈」
 - 我們希望聽到社區的意見，市府並可提供支援。請告知你們需要甚麼。我們可以提供食品、翻譯員或為你們租用地方等等。
 - 協助我們聯絡你所屬的組織

5. 唐人街-原住民關係策略簡介 – 黃永安

- 唐人街地處屬於第一民族從未割讓的土地之上，所以我們有需要明白與原住民鄰舍的關係。
- 觀看市府原住民文化規劃師 Kamala Todd 為新移民製作及由卑詩移民服務協會委託的錄像。
- 督導組的工作是起源于本市過去對華人採取歧視政策所引起的討論，而華人與原住民社區至今因為歧視所受到的傷害有不少相似的地方。
- 我們的第一步是要向原住民社區問問：“你希望與我們作出聯繫嗎？”如果他們表示有興趣的話，我們可以一同探討很多議題。
 - 作為唐人街，我們與居住在這裡的原住民之間有甚麼關係？我們認識他們嗎？他們又認識我們嗎？我們是否明白彼此的經歷呢？
- 模式按照2010年由聯邦政府撥款資助的「溫哥華對話計劃」：
 - 每個「對話圈」由為數不多的參與人士組成，每人分享自己的經歷和對未來的期盼。
 - 我們將會在督導組、唐人街組織以及原住民組織當中看看他們是否有興趣主辦他們的「對話圈」。
- 唐人街經濟文化發展專案小組將會向督導組匯報這方面的進程。

6. 2020年前瞻:

- 唐人街社區價值:
 - 請參閱附上的最新文本 (see attached) 並向專案小組提出意見。
 - 在作出決定及納入「唐人街文化遺產及資產管理計劃」(CHAMP)最終文本之前，我們將會繼續優化這些價值。
- 請參閱附上文件(2019年已完成的項目、2020優先項目及里程碑)。

7. 交誼活動 – 「害怕帽子」

- 每人將他們害怕會在唐人街出現的一個情況寫在紙條上，然後放進帽子內並抽出另一張紙條。
- 讀出紙條內容並講述自己的相關經歷。
- 害怕出現的情況：
 - 貴族化。居民將無法獲得足夠的可負擔房屋，包括可負擔的商鋪
 - 社會及經濟爆裂
 - 白鴿數目不受限制
 - 可負擔房屋及可負擔的文化事業將會被鄰近的發展項目取代(聖保祿醫院等)
 - 在社區及人際間的層面，我們讓自我阻礙了有意義的合作機會
 - 唐人街恐怕在10年後會像耶魯鎮一樣，只是高樓大廈外有一兩個中文名字。
 - 店鋪名字是中文，但唐人街在那裡？
 - 貴族化令社區消失
 - 自由市場力量將在督導組工作完成前便將唐人街貴族化，而市府對此卻無能為力(市長及市議員正在努力保護出租房屋但對保護商業租戶卻無計可施)
 - 被市中心東端壓倒及淹蓋
 - 貴族化(對甚麼類型的商戶可進入唐人街經營沒有管制，可能是令我們對貴族化擔心的原因)
 - 害怕年青一代沒有需要前來唐人街的目的。
 - 失去歷史和文化
 - 台山話和廣東話以前在唐人街十分普及，但現在已改消失了
 - 傳統的商業未來將會消失
 - 唐人街消失
 - 到處都是酒吧和咖啡館
 - 新進入唐人街的商戶不認為他們是社區的一份子
 - 孩子不能與社區及他們的台山祖裔文化作出聯繫
 - 貴族化

8. 會議結束