

FIRST SHAUGHNESSY ADVISORY DESIGN PANEL MINUTES

DATE: June 22nd, 2017
TIME: 4:00 pm
PLACE: Town Hall Meeting Room, Vancouver City Hall

PRESENT: MEMBERS OF THE FIRST SHAUGHNESSY DESIGN PANEL:

David Cuan	Chair, Resident, SHPOA
Tim Ankenmen	AIBC
Frank Shorrock	Resident, SHPOA
Kathy Reichert	Resident
Mollie Massie	Vancouver Heritage Commission
Donna Chomichuk	BCSLA
Robert Miranda	Vice chair, Resident

CITY STAFF

Susan Chang	Development Planner
Ji-Taek Park	Development Planner

REGRETS:

Catherine Evans	Park Board Commissioner
George Affleck	City Councillor
Melissa de Genova	City Councillor
Lu Xu	BCSLA
Michael Leckie	AIBC
Mamie Angus	Resident
Joanne Giesbrecht	REBGV
Pamela Lennox	Resident, SHPOA
John Madden	Resident
Nicole Clement	Property Owners Association

RECORDING

SECRETARY: Camilla Lade

ITEMS REVIEWED AT THIS MEETING

1. 1812 W. 19th Ave

Business Meeting

Chair David Cuan called the meeting to order at 4:00 pm and noted the lack of a quorum. The applicant chose to proceed although panel would not be able to vote.

- Heritage Presentation from Marco D'Agostini, Heritage Planner, deferred due to limited attendance.
- **Minutes:**
 - Due to a lack of quorum, approval of minutes was deferred to the following meeting.

- **Project updates:**
 - **1625 Matthews new house application submitted**

The Panel considered one application for presentation

Address:	1812 W. 19 th Ave
Description:	Conservation Proposal
Review:	First
Architect:	Wiedemann Architectural Design
Delegation:	Stefan Wiedemann, Architect, Wiedmann Architecture Design Julie Hicks, Landscape Architect, View Point

Planning Comments:

This conservation application proposes renovations and additions to an existing house built in 1912. The house, also known as Hugh Residence, is a good example of Colonial-revival architectural style for its simplified form and classical detailing, including shingled cladding, hipped roof with dormers, and full width porch with classical Tuscan columns.

Character defining elements include: Full width front porch on W 19th Ave. and side entrance porch on Pine Crescent with entrance door with stained glass light and crown, solid shingle-clad balustrade, wooden Tuscan columns; Front porch roof extending to form the porte-cochere including three Tuscan supporting columns mounted on shingle-clad piers; Shingle cladding from grade to the frieze plate including the base flare; Hipped roof with centered dormers on each elevation including the tongue-and-groove board soffit; Three brick chimneys with matching caps and concrete crown wash details; Double hung windows with wide frames including stained glass windows and transoms.

The dwelling has no lane. Proposed parking is located under the principal building, accessed from an existing crossing located on the north/east side of lot, on W 19th Ave. Proposed revision to the front steps re-directs the pedestrian circulation towards the south/east corner of the lot and separates from the vehicular circulation. Porte-cochere is proposed to be reduced /relocated in order to allow for the vehicle maneuvering. Side access on Pine Crescent to the side entry porch is proposed as removed, and replaced with low stone replacement wall behind retained existing hedge. Side entry porch is being retained.

Questions to Panel:

1. Can the panel comment on the success of the architectural and landscape design proposals as they relate to the expectations of the First Shaughnessy Guidelines?
2. Is the addition and proposed exterior modifications visually compatible with, subordinate to, yet, distinguishable from the existing building.

Applicant's Introductory Comments:

The applicant noted existing house is a classic building, in good shape. However, the existing front stairs lead directly to the sidewalk and does not offer an ideal entry transition. There is one parking space due to the existing porte-cochere, which does not speak to a Shaughnessy scale of a project. The intent is to maintain the massing of the original building while enabling the allowable FSR and protect a beautiful south rear yard, which is currently not engaged with the house. A pool concept was originally envisioned but scrapped to increase amount of green space. The two street facing facades will remain intact and will be restored. The addition is located to the rear and setback to be respectful to the existing building. The two-car garage is located under the porch and third under the building with significant landscape screening from the street. The existing single crossing will be maintained. The porte-cochere element is pushed back to also screen the garage.

Landscape:

The existing significant hedges on 19th and Pine will be maintained as a buffer for the garden and home. There is a layered landscaping, and screening proposed to provide buffering due to the entry stair configuration. There are small trees proposed in the front for additional screening. There is a

new wall proposed at the back with stepped terraces to the patio.

The applicant then took questions from the panel.

Panel Commentary:

- It is a good application. The project would be a great addition to the neighbourhood. The south façade needs more order. The landscape is fine. A high tech addition could have been quite beautiful as a contrast to the existing building.
- The detailed SOS is appreciated. The front stairs and railing could be changed, perhaps so there is no railing visible for the initial steps. The addition should be compatible yet distinguishable. A difference in colour can be an option to distinguish the addition. The scale of the addition on the west side is problematic particularly with the decks and the garage as it is not in keeping with the existing heritage home. It should retain the porte-cochere but there may be factors that make this difficult. It is regretful that the interior stairs as shown in the SOS are not being retained.
- Re-introduce pedestrian entry from Pine Crescent. The proposed addition is subordinate (located at the rear), but execution of how the porte-cochere is retained is problematic. The tall columns, 2 storey massing with blank walls, pit-like garage entry are not consistent with the existing house. The massing of the covered porch could be reduced as it detracts from the house and is visible from the streetscape.
- It is an impressive house and one of the best examples of Colonial Revival Style, Classic Box, and the style should be complimented and showcased. The addition could be pushed back further to distinguish the existing box shape. The porte-cochere is one of the most striking elements of the heritage house and very important in how the building engages with the street. It should not be removed as it alters a heritage element. The existing secondary street entry should be retained or a creative way to reference an entrance should be proposed. The retention of existing doors, windows, and chimneys, is encouraged. The steps from the front should have a lower landing to eliminate the need for a guardrail. Consider adding more windows on the west side. The wrought iron gates should be more 'First Shaughnessy' style.
- A gesture to recognize the pedestrian entry from Pine Crescent is worthwhile whether it is operable or not. The entry along 19th is elegant and nicely done. The porte-cochere is an important conservation element and options to retain should be explored. The two-car garage could be separated from the rest of the house as one option. On the west elevation the addition is too close to the centre line of the building and could be located further back or roof height could be lowered. The garage doors could have a trellis element to soften it instead of arched doors as it is a really intense car corner. More windows on the west side are recommended. Make the addition more distinguishable and subordinate to the massing of the house.
- Retention of side entry should be explored. The porte-cochere should be retained. The garage door design is not in keeping with First Shaughnessy District.

Chair's Summary:

It is a good presentation but there remains a lot of concern about the character defining elements that is compromised or taken out. The most important is the porte-cochere and the massing of the new addition that obscures the square box of the Colonial revival style. There were suggestions to acknowledge the second entry off of Pine Crescent, which could be done by articulating the landscaping. Maintain the clarity of the front stair so that the side steps do not require railings that would impact the straight-run look of the original design when viewed from 19th Avenue. Take another look at the location of the 4-car garage, in particular, how a re-organization could retain the existing porte-cochere. The most important thing is that the addition should be distinguishable and subordinate to the main building. The intent is evident but addition could be more distinct. Explore retaining the south dormer so that all the dormers are intact because it is a defining characteristic of the house. More windows should be added to the west facade of the new addition and set further back. Redesign the garage door with an arbour over the door, and remove the arch to improve the design but retention of porte-cochere remains the primary concern.

Applicant's Response:

The applicant thanked the panel for the thoughtful comments and plan to incorporate many of the ideas. The challenge is the porte-cochere retention, which remains the salient point of concern.

NON-VOTING ENQUIRY (due to lack of quorum)