



VANCOUVER HERITAGE COMMISSION

MINUTES

FEBRUARY 25, 2019

A meeting of the Vancouver Heritage Commission was held on Monday, February 25, 2019, at 11:00 am, in the Town Hall Meeting Room, Main Floor, City Hall.

PRESENT: Michael Kluckner, Chair
Jan Fialkowski, Vice-Chair
Michael Gordon
Denise Jacques
Janet Leduc
Joel Massey
Mollie Massie
Craig Rogers

ABSENT: Richard Keate (Leave of Absence)

ALSO PRESENT: Councillor Colleen Hardwick, Council Liaison
Zlatan Jankovic, Senior Heritage Planner, City of Vancouver,
Staff Liaison
Hugh McLean, Heritage Planner, City of Vancouver

CITY CLERK'S OFFICE: Irina Dragnea, Meeting Coordinator

WELCOME

The Chair acknowledged that we are on the unceded homelands of the Musqueam, Squamish, and Tsleil-Waututh Nations and we give thanks for their generosity and hospitality on these lands.

Leave of Absence Requests

MOVED by Commissioner Leduc
SECONDED by Commission Jacques

THAT the Vancouver Heritage Commission approve a leave of absence for Commissioner Massie for the meeting to be held March 11, 2019.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

Approval of Minutes

Commissioner Jacques provided additional detail to the February 4, 2019, minutes regarding Item 7 New Business, and inserted the wording, “and urged the relevant decision-makers to make new appointments to the Commission as soon as possible” at the end of the item.

Commissioner Leduc requested to be removed from the carried motion on being an alternate to the First Shaughnessy Advisory Design Panel.

MOVED by Commissioner Massie
SECONDED by Commissioner Fialkowski

THAT the Vancouver Heritage Commission approves the Minutes from the meeting of February 4, 2019, as amended.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

1. Business Arising from the Minutes

(a) Appointment of Alternate Liaison to the Development Permit Board

MOVED by Commissioner Massie
SECONDED by Commissioner Fialkowski

THAT the Vancouver Heritage Commission appoints Commissioner Rogers as alternate, to attend the Development Permit Board Advisory Panel in place of Commissioner Leduc, should she be unable to attend, term to commence immediately and end December 31, 2019.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

2. 402 West Pender Street – BC Securities Building VHR “B” DP-2018-01012

Issues:

- Conservation plan
- Support for façade grants

Applicant:

- Barry McGinn, Architect, McGinn Engineering and Preservation Ltd.

Staff:

- Zlatan Jankovic, Senior Heritage Planner

Staff and the applicant provided an overview of the application and responded to questions.

MOVED by Commissioner Gordon
SECONDED by Commissioner Massie

WHEREAS

1. The BC Securities Building is listed as a “B” listing on the Vancouver Heritage Register and is part of an ensemble of historic buildings in the blocks to the west of Victory Square;
2. The proposal to preserve and restore the exterior of the building, including the program of window rehabilitation and balustrade replication with cast stone, as presented by Barry McGinn, Architect, is consistent with the Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada; and
3. The proposed project meets the criteria for the city’s Heritage Façade Rehabilitation Program (HFRP).

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT the Vancouver Heritage Commission (the “Commission”) supports the application for two façade grants of \$50,000 each, for the building’s two principal façades.

FURTHER THAT the Commission commends the applicant and the owner for their stewardship of this historic resource.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

**3. 646 Richards Street – Holy Rosary Cathedral Renewal Project
VHR “A”, M - Enquiry**

Issues:

- Proposed redevelopment approach
- Proposed conservation plan, including the seismic upgrade and roof replacement

Applicants:

- Malcolm Elliot, Architect, Stantec Architecture Ltd.
- Bruno Wall, President, Wall Financial
- Robert Lemon, Architect, Heritage Consultant
- Levi Stoelting, P.Eng., Glotman – Simpson Consulting Engineers

Staff:

- Zlatan Jankovic, Senior Heritage Planner

Staff and the applicant provided an overview of the application and responded to questions.

The Vancouver Heritage Commission thanked the applicant and staff for their presentation on the Holy Rosary Cathedral Renewal Project, noting the following comments made informally in the workshop format:

- Recognizing and appreciating the congregation’s growing needs;

- Concerns with the proposed demolition of a potentially “A” and “C” VHR registered and designated buildings;
- Concerns with the incomplete Statement of Significance for the Rectory and the Hall;
- Different and more creative options to be explored to salvage as most as possible of the site, especially the Richards Street façade;
- Concerns with the access to natural light in the proposed court yard; and
- Satisfied with the design and implementation of the wheelchair accessible ramps.

MOVED by Commissioner Leduc

SECONDED by Commissioner Fialkowski

WHEREAS

1. The Holy Rosary Cathedral and its adjoining ensemble of the Rectory and the Rosary Hall have been designated as a site since December 1974;
2. The ensemble of historic buildings, including the Archbishop’s garden set behind an iron picket fence in the indented space in front of the Rectory and enclosed by the Church and the Rosary Hall, are a unique element of urban design in the contemporary city reflective of the historic Catholic community of the area’s vanished working class residential district;
3. The Rectory, built in 1935, is a rare example of the English Collegiate style tentatively evaluated as an “A” listing on the Vancouver Heritage Register, the loss of which would greatly diminish the heritage and historic values of the Church;
4. The front portion of the Rosary Hall, built in 1907, is a rare example of the Italianate style in downtown Vancouver, the loss of which would diminish the heritage and historic values of the adjoining two buildings; and
5. The applicant has alluded to scenarios for the possible rehabilitation and reuse of these buildings, but has not, to the Vancouver Heritage Commission’s knowledge, explored alternative means, such as grants or other programs, to achieve the programmatic improvements, seismic upgrading and elements of the Conservation Plan for the Church that are the rationale for the project.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED

- A. THAT the Vancouver Heritage Commission (the “Commission”), while sympathetic to the desire of the congregation to expand its offerings, is unable to support the enquiry to redevelop the non-church portion of the site, as presented to the Commission on February 25, 2019.
- B. THAT the Vancouver Heritage Commission (the “Commission”) requests that the draft Statement of Significance presented to the Statement of Significance Subcommittee be amended to include new material, specifically the research provided to the Commission by Heritage Vancouver, on the age and provenance of the Rosary Hall.
- C. THAT the Vancouver Heritage Commission recommends that the applicant explore means by which at least partial retention of the Rectory, the Rosary Hall and the elevations along Richards Street can be retained.

- D. THAT the Vancouver Heritage Commission (the “Commission”) requests that staff develop and that Council support incentive programs sufficiently robust to allow historic buildings, such as the Holy Rosary Cathedral, to be seismically upgraded and programmatically modified to meet current codes without resorting to a funding scenario such as the one presented to the Commission on February 25, 2019; and

FURTHER THAT the Commission recommends a pro forma be prepared to specify the actual costs of the seismic and life-safety upgrades as well as additions to the church’s facilities, such as the Columbarium proposed for the basement level.

- E. THAT the Vancouver Heritage Commission notes that the wheelchair ramp as proposed on the northeast corner of the church should receive further design development.

CARRIED

(Commissioner Rogers opposed)

(Commissioner Jacques abstained)

(Section 145.1 of the Vancouver Charter states “Where a member present at meeting abstains from voting, they are deemed to have voted in the affirmative.”)

* * * * *

The Commission recessed at 1:23 pm and reconvened at 1:36 pm.

* * * * *

**4. 959 East 35th Avenue – The Bramble Store and Apartment
VHR “B” (proposed), designation and HRA
DP-2018-00534**

Issues:

- Conservation Plan
- Ownership plan
- Use of outdoor space
- Continuity of neighbourhood retail use

Applicant:

- Brendan Callander, Birmingham and Wood Architects and Planners

Staff:

- Hugh McLean, Heritage Planner

Staff and the applicant provided an overview of the application and responded to questions.

MOVED by Commissioner Fialkowski
SECONDED by Commissioner Massey

WHEREAS

1. The Vancouver Heritage Commission, at its meeting on November 19, 2018, generally supported the application to rehabilitate the Bramble Store and Apartment (the “Heritage Building”);
2. Neighbourhood store buildings on residential streets, especially those continuing to operate as retail outlets, are very rare survivors in the contemporary city; and
3. The applicant has presented a satisfactory Conservation Plan for the Heritage Building.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT the Vancouver Heritage Commission (the “Commission”) supports the proposal to protect and rehabilitate the Bramble Store and Apartment (the “Heritage Building”) and to construct a new One Family Dwelling with an option for a secondary suite at the front of the site, noting the following:

- a. The Commission supports the use of a Heritage Revitalization Agreement (HRA) to secure the commercial use of the Heritage Building and to vary the density and other non-conforming conditions.
- b. The Commission requests that a colour investigation be made after the stucco is removed and that those findings be considered when choosing a colour scheme for the store.
- c. The Commission reserves judgement on the matter of the site’s ownership, noting that a fee simple lot with the commercial covenant might be a satisfactory way to manage issues, such as the use of the outdoor space, which ought to be vested in the Heritage Building rather than in the strata corporation itself.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

5. Statement of Significance and Vancouver Heritage Register Subcommittee Report

Staff reviewed the report from the Statement of Significance and Vancouver Heritage Register Subcommittee meeting held on January 21, 2019.

MOVED by Commissioner Massie
SECONDED by Commissioner Fialkowski

THAT the Vancouver Heritage Commission requests that the Statements of Significance for the following buildings be referred back to the consultant for revisions:

- 835-837 Beatty Street – Anglo-Canadian Warehouse Building
- 1517 Comox Street – George Residence; and
- 2006 Whyte Avenue – Bell Residence.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

6. New Business

(a) Commissioners' Reports

The Chair noted that there was an online (change.org) petition circulating to save the Salvation Army Building at Gore Street and Hastings Street.

Commissioner Jacques reminded staff of the need for Standards and Guidelines training for the Commissioners. The Commission decided to wait until there is full member complement before the training occurs.

Commissioner Gordon inquired with staff for an update/presentation to the Commission on the Broadway Plan. Staff agreed to organize for the Commission.

Due to time constraints, staff will be providing an update on the Regulatory Review, the status of the Fairmount Academy and follow-up answers to Commissioner Leduc's inquiry on City policies around paving over bricks in Yaletown, at the next regular Commission meeting.

Adjournment

MOVED by Commissioner Massie
SECONDED by Commissioner Jacques

THAT this meeting be adjourned.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

Next Meeting:

DATE: Monday, March 11, 2019
TIME: 11 am
PLACE: Town Hall Meeting Room
Main Floor, City Hall

The Committee adjourned at 2:05 pm.

* * * * *